

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

FRANKLIN COUNTY BOARD OF ELECTIONS
REGULAR MEETING
1700 Morse Road
Columbus, Ohio 43229

- - -

Monday, July 1, 2024
3:00 p.m.

- - -

- BEFORE:
- Douglas J. Preisse, Chairman
 - Meredith Freedhoff
 - Kimberly E. Marinello
 - Anton White, Director
 - David Payne, Deputy Director
 - Erin Gibbons, Executive Manager

- - -

Higgins & Associates
Court Reporting - Legal Video - Videoconference
4889 Sinclair Road, Suite 102
Columbus, Ohio 43229
*614.985.DEPO (3376) *888.244.1211

1 APPEARANCES:

2 ON BEHALF OF THE FRANKLIN COUNTY BOARD OF
3 ELECTIONS:

3

G. Gary Tyack, Esquire
Franklin County Prosecutor
By: Jeanine Hummer, Esquire
Assistant County Prosecutor
and
Brian Zagrocki, Esquire
Assistant County Prosecutor
373 South High Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215
(614) 525-3555

4

5

6

7

8

9

ALSO PRESENT:

10 Travis Simmons
11 Jeffrey Gatwood
12 Matthew Kelly

13

- - -

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1	<u>I</u> <u>N</u> <u>D</u> <u>E</u> <u>X</u>	
2	- - -	
3	WITNESSES	PAGE
4	Jennifer M. Loshark	12
5		
6	- - -	
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		

1 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: I'll go
2 ahead and take roll. Mike Sexton? Kim Marinello?

3 MEMBER MARINELLO: Here.

4 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: Doug
5 Preisse?

6 MEMBER PREISSE: Here.

7 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: Meredith
8 Freedhoff?

9 MEMBER FREEDHOFF: Here.

10 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: We do have a
11 quorum, Mr. Chairman.

12 The first item on the agenda is the
13 approval of minutes from May 6, 2024. I believe
14 those were sent out to you.

15 MEMBER MARINELLO: Yes.

16 Mr. Chairman, I move that the Board approve the
17 minutes of the May 6, 2024 meeting in the Franklin
18 County Board of Elections as submitted.

19 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Second the
20 motion.

21 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: Properly
22 moved and seconded.

23 All of those in favor of the motion,
24 signify by saying "aye."

1 (All members of the board voted unanimously by
2 saying aye.)

3 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: All of those
4 opposed, same sign.

5 Motion carries.

6 Originally, we had scheduled the
7 Brown Township Zoning referendum to be heard today.
8 And I think we've been advised by counsel that --
9 we were asked for a continuance?

10 MS. HUMMER: Yes. We were asked by
11 legal counsel for a continuance. The lawyer who is
12 presenting and filed the protest is delayed due to
13 traffic -- air traffic issues in another state.

14 So he's not -- and I can attest to
15 that because my daughter was in the same situation
16 yesterday and just arrived home late today. So
17 it's across the board. I believe there's air
18 traffic problems.

19 So the request is before the Board.
20 The Board would have to move to grant the
21 continuance and vote on it.

22 Right now, my recommendation would
23 be that you move it to your next date, and if you
24 subsequently decide to hold a special meeting, and

1 move it up, the staff, the director and deputy
2 director will provide proper notice to the parties
3 to be here for the special meeting and comply with
4 the open meeting requirement.

5 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: So we don't have
6 any reference to that on the agenda.

7 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: We don't.
8 We had it on there, and we took it off. I didn't
9 realize we were going to have to make some sort of
10 a motion.

11 MS. HUMMER: I can walk you through
12 that. It's a motion for a continuance of the
13 challenge -- I'm sorry -- a motion to continue the
14 protest hearing. You will require a second, and
15 then you'll vote to the next available.

16 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: On the Brown
17 Township --

18 MS. HUMMER: Referendum.

19 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Zoning
20 referendum, I move that we postpone until the next
21 regular or, if necessary, special board meeting
22 relative to the Brown Township Zoning referendum.

23 MEMBER MARINELLO: Second.

24 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: It's been

1 properly moved and seconded.

2 All of those in favor, signify by
3 saying "aye."

4 (All members of the board voted unanimously by
5 saying aye.)

6 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: All opposed,
7 same sign.

8 Motion carries.

9 The next item on the agenda, we have
10 four voter challenges. I'm going call to on Travis
11 Simmons, our director -- or manager of Voter
12 Services to walk us through those.

13 MR. SIMMONS: Good afternoon. I'm
14 Travis Simmons. I'm the manager of the Voter
15 Services Department here at the Franklin County
16 Board of Elections.

17 The first challenge we will hear is
18 the challenge of Mary Beth Breyfogle challenging
19 the voter registration status of Brenna Kirk.

20 MS. GIBBONS: Is anybody here for --
21 can you say their names again? I'm sorry.

22 MR. SIMMONS: Petitioner is David
23 Breyfogle.

24 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Mary Beth

1 Breyfogle?

2 MR. SIMMONS: Mary Beth.

3 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Neither one of
4 them is here, I assume?

5 MS. GIBBONS: Who was the other
6 person, the person challenging?

7 MR. SIMMONS: That's the person
8 challenging. Do you want to --

9 MS. HUMMER: Postpone that. Move to
10 postpone that matter to the next.

11 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Because?

12 MS. HUMMER: You don't have the
13 person who is actually challenging.

14 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: We don't have an
15 affidavit that could suffice?

16 MS. HUMMER: I don't know if you
17 can.

18 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: I don't think we
19 do, do we?

20 MS. HUMMER: No.

21 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Moot question.
22 Then we just pass. We don't have to move to change
23 it, do we?

24 MS. HUMMER: You move to postpone

1 that matter so we can attempt to have contact with
2 the individual, or you can deny the request as
3 submitted.

4 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Can we approve
5 the request as submitted?

6 MS. HUMMER: Well, you won't have
7 the information directly from the person who is the
8 challenger.

9 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Oh.

10 MEMBER FREEDHOFF: I move that the
11 Board delays the challenge filed by Mary Beth
12 Breyfogle against Brenna D. Kirk of the same
13 address until the next meeting or whenever the
14 plaintiffs are available and the challenger.

15 MEMBER MARINELLO: I second.

16 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: It's been
17 properly moved and seconded.

18 All of those in favor signify by
19 saying "aye."

20 (All members of the board voted unanimously by
21 saying aye.)

22 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: All opposed,
23 same sign.

24 Motion carries.

1 MR. SIMMONS: The next challenge we
2 have is Jennifer Loshark. She is challenging the
3 voter registration status of Carl Hudson and Luis
4 Caralaca.

5 So I'll begin. Carl Hudson
6 originally registered to vote in Franklin County on
7 the 6th of May of this year with a paper
8 registration form.

9 Later that same month Mr. Hudson
10 completed another registration which updated his
11 address to which requested his address be updated
12 to 6624 Canaan Circle, Dublin, Ohio 43017.
13 Mr. Hudson has never voted in Franklin County.

14 The petitioner is challenger
15 Jennifer Loshark, originally registered to vote in
16 Franklin County in 1992. She has been registered
17 at 6624 Canaan Circle, Dublin, Ohio 43017 since
18 2005. Ms. Loshark regularly votes at the polls on
19 election day from that address.

20 Other than Ms. Loshark and
21 Mr. Hudson, there is one other voter registered at
22 that address, Mr. Luis Caralaca, whose registration
23 is being challenged also which we'll talk about
24 next by Ms. Loshark. He is registered to vote at

1 6624 Canaan Circle.

2 Since there's two, do we need to do
3 them separately?

4 MS. HUMMER: The vote will be
5 separately, but you can present.

6 MR. SIMMONS: The second person that
7 is being challenged by Ms. Loshark is Luis
8 Caralaca.

9 Mr. Caralaca originally registered
10 to vote in Franklin County on the 23rd of May of
11 this year with a paper registration.
12 Mr. Caralaca's registration form was processed.
13 Doing our routine check, the BMV and Social
14 Security Administration and confirmed that the name
15 and date of birth and identification information on
16 the registration form did not match any records for
17 an existing person in the BMV or Social Security
18 Administration databases.

19 At that time, Mr. Caralaca's
20 registration was changed to inactive, and a
21 confirmation notice was sent to the address on file
22 to obtain the correct information from
23 Mr. Caralaca.

24 We have -- the Voter Services

1 Department has yet to receive a reply from that
2 confirmation notice. Mr. Caralaca has never voted
3 in Franklin County.

4 As stated earlier, Ms. Loshark
5 originally registered to vote in Franklin County in
6 1992. She has been registered at 6624 Canaan
7 Circle in Dublin, Ohio 43017 since 2005. She
8 regularly votes at the polls from that address.

9 The Voter Services -- due to
10 Ms. Loshark's challenge to Carl Hudson and Luis
11 Caralaca, the Voter Services Department recommends
12 to uphold her challenge due to suspicious nature of
13 both of these voter registration forms returned for
14 these voters.

15 So the Voter Services Department
16 recommend that the challenge be accepted and these
17 voters be removed from the voter rolls, Carl Hudson
18 and Luis Caralaca.

19 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Do we wish any
20 questions for staff, or do we wish to hear from
21 Ms. Loshark?

22 MS. LOSHARK: Loshark.

23 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Loanshark.

24 MS. LOSHARK: No n. I never heard

1 that before.

2 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Sorry. I'm sure
3 you haven't. Could we hear from you? If you would
4 like to please join us and the court reporter will
5 swear you in.

6 JENNIFER LOSHARK

7 being first duly sworn, testifies as follows:

8 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Can you give us a
9 brief overview of what we just heard or any
10 additional pertinent details you wish to share.

11 MS. LOSHARK: Do you want me to do
12 them separate or together?

13 MS. HUMMER: Do them sequentially.

14 MS. LOSHARK: Because it kind of
15 runs together.

16 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Do the first one
17 first and run it into the second.

18 MS. LOSHARK: So I got this
19 letter -- I don't know if you require a copy of
20 this or you want to keep it -- on June 7, addressed
21 to a Carl Hudson. His acknowledgement notice of
22 his application to register to vote or update his
23 registration had been received using my address of
24 6624 Canaan Circle, Dublin, Ohio 43017. He does

1 not live here. I do not know who this man is. I
2 have never heard from him. He's not an old tenant
3 of my neighbors. He's never lived at this address.
4 He's never been a roommate of any of my other
5 neighbors ever.

6 I bought my house August 24, 2005.
7 It legally transferred into my name on August 31,
8 2005 in the Franklin County Auditor's office. He's
9 never lived with me. He wasn't even part of the
10 former owners.

11 So, with this notice, I scanned it
12 and I emailed it to the Franklin County Board of
13 Elections filing and said, "I don't know who this
14 guy is. He's not registered to vote. What's going
15 on?"

16 So I got an email from Sara. I
17 think she is your boss. She said, "Okay." She
18 sent me the voter challenge forms, and she also
19 said, "Hey, we found a Luis Caralaca."

20 It's actually C-a-r-a-l-a-c-a, and
21 it's Luis, L-u-i-s, registered also at my address.

22 So she went ahead and had me fill
23 out both of the forms separately, which I did; and
24 I returned to her. I also had filed a police

1 report and something with the Secretary of State's
2 office because I investigate fraud for a living,
3 and no one is going to be doing this to me.

4 So I also do not know who this Luis
5 Caralaca is. I have never met him. He's not an
6 old flame or a neighbor. He's never lived in my
7 address ever, never. So I've been the only one
8 registered at my address since 2005.

9 So if you would like some supporting
10 documents, which I understand the subpoena
11 requested, I have a copy of my water bill, a copy
12 of my internet bill, a copy of my electric bill. I
13 have a copy of my deed. I have a copy of the deed
14 history from my address. I have all copies of all
15 the deeds from my 6624 Canaan Circle. I have a
16 copy of my taxes.

17 So if you would like all of these
18 documents for the record, everything has been
19 properly redacted so none of my accounts or
20 personal information is on there, just my name and
21 address.

22 MS. HUMMER: Are those copies?

23 MS. LOSHARK: Yes, these are all
24 copies.

1 MS. HUMMER: Can I look at them and
2 I can submit to the Board whether they think --

3 MS. LOSHARK: I can walk them over
4 to her.

5 If you need to see my driver's
6 license, I have that with me.

7 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: What's that?

8 MS. LOSHARK: I have my driver's
9 license if you need to see that.

10 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Did you drive
11 here today?

12 MS. LOSHARK: Yeah. It doesn't mean
13 everybody brings them with them.

14 MS. HUMMER: I think you can take
15 judicial notice that the documents presented do
16 roughly show that this individual, Jennifer
17 Loshark, is the owner of the property.

18 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: We note we had
19 received that sheath of documents and counsel has
20 reviewed them. Thank you.

21 Let's move on to the second.

22 MS. LOSHARK: The second? That was
23 all wrapped into one.

24 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Oh, that was all

1 wrapped into one.

2 MS. LOSHARK: It transformed to
3 Luis.

4 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: You did say Luis.
5 What did you say, his name was incorrectly noticed
6 in our materials?

7 MS. LOSHARK: I just spelled it out.
8 I don't know if this is relevant,
9 but I did find out they're all registered to vote
10 through that Black Rock Strategies Company.

11 I attempted to reach out to them and
12 tell them to cease and desist.

13 DIRECTOR WHITE: If I may, Chairman
14 Preisse, all four of these challenges today come
15 from Blackfork Registration Group. Blackfork is a
16 group. They send out paid individuals to go out
17 and try to register people to vote.

18 So our office and our voter services
19 staff along with Deputy Director and myself, we've
20 been working with this group to try to understand
21 their mission. We've met with them on several
22 occasions. We've given them advice on, you know,
23 proper proceedings and things of that nature.

24 And so we're working with them to

1 find out on some of these instances -- we're
2 investigating to find out what's going on; and
3 anything that we find through our investigation,
4 we'll bring back to the Board.

5 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: They're aware of
6 these challenges today?

7 DIRECTOR WHITE: I believe they are.

8 MR. SIMMONS: Yeah, they are. A few
9 other ones as well.

10 DIRECTOR WHITE: Yeah. We'll
11 continue to work with that group and conduct our
12 investigative steps; and then anything that's
13 relevant, we'll bring to the Board.

14 MEMBER FREEDHOFF: When you met with
15 them, did you ask them if they require any ID when
16 they register a person to vote?

17 DIRECTOR WHITE: I don't know if we
18 asked that specifically, but when we met with them
19 to understand their process, and then they got some
20 ways they track what they turn in to boards of
21 elections, we're not the only county where they do
22 this at. They do it in multiple counties. So we
23 want to understand their process; and, you know,
24 how they collect registrations, when they bring a

1 registration to us, we know what their process is,
2 and so we have a connection there.

3 We had actually offered to provide
4 some training to their staff, which they have yet
5 to take us up on. So we'll continue to work with
6 them. We'll do our investigations and then we'll
7 bring any information to the Board that's relevant.

8 MEMBER FREEDHOFF: It's concerning
9 to me that they have two people registered at one
10 address that have never been there. How did they
11 come to that address?

12 DIRECTOR WHITE: That's what we're
13 attempting to find out.

14 MEMBER FREEDHOFF: Thank you.

15 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Any other
16 questions of the Board?

17 MS. LOSHARK: Do you have any more
18 questions for me?

19 MEMBER FREEDHOFF: No, Ma'am.

20 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: With that, I just
21 want to thank you for --

22 MEMBER MARINELLO: Yes, thank you.

23 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: -- your due
24 diligence in opening other people's mail.

1 MS. LOSHARK: Yes. It's my address.
2 It's fair game.

3 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Thank you very
4 much, sincerely.

5 MS. LOSHARK: You're welcome. Thank
6 you.

7 MEMBER MARINELLO: Mr. Chairman, I
8 move the Board -- are we ready for a motion for the
9 first one?

10 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Yes, I think so.

11 MEMBER MARINELLO: I move the Board
12 approve the challenge of the right to vote filed by
13 Jennifer M. Loshark, 6624 Canaan Circle, Dublin,
14 Ohio, against Carl Hudson at the same address.
15 Carl Hudson's registration be removed from the
16 Franklin County Board of Elections voter file.

17 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Second the
18 motion.

19 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: Been
20 properly moved and seconded. Those in favor,
21 signify by saying "aye."

22 (All members of the board voted unanimously by
23 saying aye.)

24 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: All opposed,

1 same sign.

2 Motion carries.

3 MEMBER FREEDHOFF: Chairman, I move
4 that the Board approve the challenge of the right
5 to vote filed by Jennifer M. Loshark, 6624 Canaan
6 Circle Drive, Dublin, Ohio against Luis Caralaca,
7 the same address and order that Luis Caralaca's
8 registration be removed from the Franklin County
9 Board of Elections voter file.

10 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Doug Preisse
11 seconds the motion.

12 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: It's been
13 properly moved and seconded.

14 All of those in favor of the motion
15 signify by saying "aye."

16 (All members of the board voted unanimously by
17 saying aye.)

18 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: All opposed,
19 same sign.

20 Motion carries.

21 I believe there's one more voter
22 challenge.

23 MR. SIMMONS: Yes. Is Jeffrey Arman
24 here?

1 MR. SIMMONS: Yes. Jeffrey Arman is
2 challenging the voter registration status of Ashley
3 Marie Latham.

4 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Okay. Neither
5 party is here? And, counsel, refresh my memory
6 again -- he is here?

7 MR. SIMMONS: He's not here.

8 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Refresh my memory
9 again.

10 MS. HUMMER: We do tell these
11 individuals who come forward with a challenge that
12 they have to be present, provide testimony to the
13 Board in order for the Board to properly assess
14 their challenge. Since it's such a very important
15 power to vote and to have the right, people need to
16 be present before you make an informed decision.

17 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: And we've --

18 MR. SIMMONS: Yes, sir.

19 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: We've attempted
20 to contact both? Probably right here, right?

21 MS. GIBBONS: Yeah, we sent
22 subpoenas to all parties involved at any address
23 that we have for them, and we also -- we also
24 notice it in the daily reporter.

1 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: So you're
2 recommending that we postpone this too.

3 MS. HUMMER: What we'll probably do
4 is send out a letter that says failure to appear
5 will be a dismissal of this. Because it's only
6 coming forward to you because someone has brought
7 it forward.

8 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: And Ms. Latham
9 has voted or not voted?

10 MR. SIMMONS: She has never voted in
11 Franklin County. There's been a bunch of
12 registration forms sent in to us during the months
13 of April and May for her, but she's never voted in
14 Franklin County.

15 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Has anybody
16 looked for her in the barn? That sounds
17 superfluous, but I know Latham means "from the
18 barn" in Anglo-Saxon. I know that's irrelevant in
19 today's discussion, but in English that's all I
20 have to offer.

21 MS. HUMMER: You can be my
22 phone-a-friend.

23 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: I will move that
24 we postpone the challenge of registration of Ashley

1 Marie Latham until the Board -- until such meeting
2 where the Board has exhausted further efforts to
3 communicate with her and the challenger.

4 MEMBER MARINELLO: Second.

5 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: It's been
6 properly moved and seconded. All of those in
7 favor, signify by saying "aye."

8 (All members of the board voted unanimously by
9 saying aye.)

10 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: All opposed,
11 same sign.

12 Motion carries.

13 The next item on the agenda is the
14 purchase of some voting machine equipment. I'll
15 turn that over to Anton White our Director of the
16 Board of Elections.

17 DIRECTOR WHITE: Good afternoon.

18 Thanks, David. Today we're asking your approval on
19 a contract modification. It will be a second
20 contract modification with the election system and
21 software ES&S, which is our voter equipment
22 provider.

23 We're seeking your approval for the
24 purchase of 278 voting machines and 20 DS200

1 precinct scanners.

2 With the upcoming election, we've
3 got voter registration numbers -- we thought it was
4 prudent that we purchase a few extra pieces of
5 equipment for the November election.

6 Some of the equipment will be used
7 for poll worker training. Some of the other
8 equipment is a bit dated and so we need to replace
9 some pieces of equipment there.

10 In addition we'll use some of this
11 equipment for our vote center, and we'll have some
12 additional equipment to deploy out on election day.
13 We would ask for the approval for the purchase of
14 278 ballot markers and 20 DS200 precinct scanners.
15 I'm sorry. I'm looking for the amount here. The
16 amount is \$1,244,360.

17 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Anything to say
18 on that, David?

19 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: I don't
20 think so. Just that what the director -- echo what
21 he said.

22 We are in need of those for
23 training, and some of our machines are getting
24 older; and so we're kind of putting them out.

1 MEMBER MARINELLO: Probably safe.

2 I move the Board authorize the
3 purchase of 278 ExpressVote voting machines, 20
4 barcode scanners as well as a software and firmware
5 licensing support from Election Systems & Software
6 for a total cost of \$1,244,360.

7 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Second the
8 motion.

9 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: It's been
10 properly moved and seconded.

11 All in favor of the motion, signify
12 by saying "aye."

13 (All members of the board voted unanimously by
14 saying aye.)

15 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: All opposed,
16 same sign.

17 Motion carries.

18 The next item on the agenda is the
19 upgrade and purchase of an IVR system software.

20 And I'll turn that over to our IT
21 Director Jeff Gatwood.

22 MR. GATWOOD: Good afternoon. For
23 the IVR upgrade, we currently have an IVR system
24 that handles a lot of self-service phone calls.

1 Obviously, during --

2 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: What does IVR
3 stand for?

4 MR. GATWOOD: Interactive voice
5 response.

6 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Oh, right.

7 MR. GATWOOD: So we do our
8 self-service options on that. We process probably
9 about 16,000 calls during a presidential election
10 the month leading up to the election date. So
11 obviously it is a very valuable tool in helping us
12 serve our voters and making sure that we can
13 provide the information they're requesting.

14 Our current environment is on
15 outdated hardware. That's what's supported by the
16 data center. They will be providing additional new
17 hardware for us, and the vendor is going to be
18 supplying the updated software that runs the system
19 that also is in need of upgrade.

20 In addition to doing that, we
21 currently only have one IVR system in place. So if
22 it should fail we are not able to support all of
23 those incoming calls. So we're putting in a
24 redundant system.

1 Any questions?

2 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: What's that
3 physically look like on our premises?

4 MR. GATWOOD: It's actually hosted
5 in the data center. It's a virtual machine.

6 MR. PREISSE: So nothing here?

7 MR. GATWOOD: Correct.

8 MR. PREISSE: The county data
9 center.

10 MR. GATWOOD: It's in the county
11 data center, correct.

12 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Why don't we ask
13 them to pay for it? I guess we get our money from
14 them anyway.

15 MR. GATWOOD: Yes.

16 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: For the most
17 part. Questions for Director Gatwood?

18 MEMBER MARINELLO: No.

19 MEMBER FREEDHOFF: Thank you.

20 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Thank you.

21 MR. GATWOOD: Thank you.

22 MEMBER FREEDHOFF: Mr. Chairman, I
23 move the Board authorize the upgrade and purchase
24 of the IVR system software for two virtual

1 production servers at a total of cost of \$30,800.

2 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Second the
3 motion.

4 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: It's been
5 properly moved and seconded. All of those in favor
6 signify by saying "aye."

7 (All of the board members voted unanimously by
8 saying aye.)

9 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: All opposed,
10 same sign.

11 Motion carries.

12 The next item on the agenda is a
13 lease agreement for poll worker training, and I'll
14 turn that over to Anton White our director.

15 DIRECTOR WHITE: Hello once again.
16 This is a license agreement for your approval for a
17 space to train our poll workers for the upcoming
18 presidential election.

19 The last several elections we've
20 been able to somewhat handle poll worker training
21 out of this facility as we also are simultaneously
22 doing early voting. But with numbers we anticipate
23 for early voting, we're going to need every space
24 of our building to service early voters; and so

1 with that, we're asking for your approval to lease
2 a facility to 19,000 -- approximately 19,000
3 square-foot facility located over in Worthington
4 that we'll be able to use temporarily to train.
5 We'll probably train up to 5,200 poll workers this
6 year.

7 MEMBER FREEDHOFF: What numbers are
8 you looking at for November and early voting coming
9 through here?

10 DIRECTOR WHITE: In 2020 we -- I
11 think Matt is here. 2020 we voted 117,000 here.
12 And as I said, I think we anticipate somewhere in
13 that range again. And so when we get that in
14 2020 -- now, given 2020 was a pandemic. So we had
15 different requirements in terms of spacing, spacing
16 of equipment, spacing of voters. And so we
17 actually moved the warehouse offsite in order to
18 accomplish that in 2020.

19 Now, we don't have those same
20 requirements this time around, but with the need to
21 put up at least 150 machines so we can service
22 upwards of a 1,000 voters per hour. Thinking, you
23 know, we anticipate a heavy turnout, we need the
24 extra space in here to set up those machines, to

1 set up queuing, to set up check-ins. So taking our
2 poll working training offsite will help us
3 accomplish that.

4 We're actually working with the
5 county on some space planning at this area to
6 accomplish permanent poll worker training here.
7 We're just not there yet.

8 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: What's the status
9 of the building next door?

10 DIRECTOR WHITE: The HomeBuys. Is
11 that what you're referring to?

12 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Didn't one of our
13 neighbors go out of business? And are we buying
14 it, or is the county buying it?

15 DIRECTOR WHITE: The former HomeBuys
16 facility, they went out of business.

17 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Are they directly
18 next door?

19 DIRECTOR WHITE: Just a little ways
20 down on the same property. They left and the
21 county did acquire that building.

22 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: With us in mind
23 or something else?

24 DIRECTOR WHITE: With us in mind,

1 yes.

2 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Did you approve
3 that purchase?

4 MS. HUMMER: We were all over that
5 purchase.

6 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: I have a higher
7 level of confidence now. You're going to ensure
8 that we get most of the space?

9 MS. HUMMER: That's our goal. We're
10 excited about it.

11 MEMBER MARINELLO: Awesome.

12 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Okay. Who is HJH
13 Columbus 1 LLC? Do we know? That's over near the
14 college, isn't it?

15 DIRECTOR WHITE: This is right off
16 of -- the space is actually -- I think the owner is
17 an out-of-town entity, but the actual physical
18 building is Crosswoods, right off of 23 and 270.

19 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Okay.

20 DIRECTOR WHITE: We actually worked
21 with the county to locate that space. I mean, we
22 actually had put out a bid for space that didn't
23 yield any tangible results. So we were working
24 with the prosecutor's office in purchasing. We

1 were able to go out and find a space that would fit
2 our needs, and we were able to negotiate a price
3 and comes to terms and an agreements.

4 MS. HUMMER: Almost like a sole
5 source arrangement because Anton is probably not
6 properly describing all the work and effort both
7 this office and our office put forward to go
8 through our process to try to find rental space at
9 the same time while negotiating to purchase the
10 space that's directly next door and to work those
11 out in such a way that the timing would be such.
12 We didn't know whether we could get the next door
13 space in time for the election for training, and we
14 listened to the director and continued to pursue
15 the RP in finding the rental space and so.

16 MEMBER MARINELLO: I bet that's a
17 load off your mind.

18 DIRECTOR WHITE: This is
19 important -- an important step for us to be able to
20 get our poll workers trained properly and conduct
21 everything here properly.

22 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Understand.
23 Thank you. Any other questions?

24 MEMBER MARINELLO: No.

1 Mr. Chairman, I move Franklin County Board of
2 Elections enter into a lease agreement with HJH
3 Columbus 1 LLC with the property at 200 East Campus
4 View Boulevard for use of a training facility for
5 poll workers. This lease began on June 14, 2024,
6 and is set to expire on December 31 for the monthly
7 rent of \$23,671.25.

8 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Second the
9 motion.

10 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: It's been
11 properly moved and seconded. All of those in favor
12 signify by saying "aye."

13 (All members of the board voted unanimously by
14 saying aye.)

15 DEPUTY DIRECTOR WHITE: All opposed,
16 same sign.

17 Motion carries.

18 The next item on the agenda is the
19 audit of an air gap network. Again, I'll turn that
20 Jeff Gatwood our IT director.

21 MR. GATWOOD: Good afternoon again.
22 This is a request from an audit of our air gap
23 network. An air gap network is simply a network
24 that is isolated from other networks and the

1 internet.

2 Our voting system ES&S is on this
3 along with out tabulators so it's important to make
4 sure that it is isolated from everything else.

5 Over the years we've had to move
6 some of the wiring. We found out that physically
7 hardens the environment the equipment resides in.
8 At that time we have not gone back and evaluated.
9 So is just to confirm that we have not done
10 anything to upset the environment that we created
11 to isolate all of this equipment. So we're asking
12 for a third party to come in to evaluate all of our
13 work.

14 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: And this would --
15 tell us about Blue Bastion.

16 MR. GATWOOD: In trying to find a
17 company that was qualified to do the evaluation, I
18 was looking for somebody that was local to the
19 State of Ohio so they could help us understand our
20 election environment, finding a company that had
21 some election experience; and this was the company
22 I was able to find that satisfied those conditions.

23 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Are they a
24 central Ohio company.

1 MR. GATWOOD: They have
2 representation in Worthington. They're actually
3 headquartered out of Pittsburgh.

4 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Have you worked
5 with them before?

6 MR. GATWOOD: I have not.

7 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: When would this
8 commence?

9 MR. GATWOOD: As soon as we get
10 approval.

11 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Okay. It sounds
12 like a good idea. Is this something we're mandated
13 to do?

14 MR. GATWOOD: No, it is not
15 something we're mandated to do. This is something
16 I felt was probably a wise thing to do before a
17 major election.

18 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Because we are
19 very often questioned as to the integrity of our
20 systems database and the interconnectivity with the
21 State and Franklin County.

22 MR. GATWOOD: Right.

23 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: And everything
24 else so.

1 MR. GATWOOD: And there's no reason
2 to doubt the integrity of our environment. At same
3 time, we never had a third party evaluate it.

4 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: I like it.
5 Freedhoff, what do you think?

6 MEMBER FREEDHOFF: Have they done
7 other boards of elections?

8 MR. GATWOOD: They have not, but the
9 primary principals of the company have done
10 election work for other countries. So they do have
11 election experience. They're familiar what is
12 needed to support an election.

13 MEMBER FREEDHOFF: So they're
14 located here and what? But they don't do boards of
15 elections?

16 MR. GATWOOD: No. They do have
17 representation here in Worthington. The company is
18 headquartered out of Pittsburgh.

19 MEMBER FREEDHOFF: So do they work
20 for other countries out of Worthington?

21 MR. GATWOOD: Well, they have
22 other -- they do more than just boards of
23 elections. They do regular enterprise work in
24 terms of network evaluations.

1 MEMBER FREEDHOFF: Oh, like private
2 companies?

3 MR. GATWOOD: Yes.

4 MEMBER FREEDHOFF: Thank you.

5 MR. GATWOOD: Yep.

6 MEMBER FREEDHOFF: No more questions
7 for me. I move -- Chairman, I move that the Board
8 retain the services of Blue Bastion to provide an
9 independent third-party air gap network at a
10 \$39,680.

11 MEMBER MARINELLO: Second.

12 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: It's been
13 properly moved and seconded. All of those in favor
14 signify by saying "aye."

15 (All members of the board voted unanimously by
16 saying aye.)

17 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: All opposed
18 same sign.

19 Motion carries.

20 The next item on the agenda is the
21 purchase of ballot stock. I'll turn that over to
22 Matt Kelly our Absentee Manager.

23 MR. KELLY: Chairman, Members of the
24 Board, good afternoon. I'm here today to ask for

1 approval of the purchase of additional ballot stock
2 for this upcoming election.

3 Every election we look at potential
4 numbers of absentee by mail voters. We want to
5 make sure we have an enough ballot stock in the
6 building so we can service those voters even if the
7 ballot would go to a two-sheet ballot.

8 So we're anticipating a one-sheet
9 ballot from what everything I've heard. I think we
10 can stick to that, but if we would happen to go to
11 a two-sheet ballot, we want to make sure we have
12 ballot stock in the house, ready to go just in
13 case.

14 So we do have around 320,000 sheets
15 of ballot stock inhouse. We're asking to purchase
16 an additional 320,000 sheets so we have enough
17 paper ballot stock to be used in the election in
18 2024, the General Election 2024; that includes
19 purchasing enough ballot stock to take care of
20 preprinted ballots for election day, a test deck
21 that we run to test all of our machinery; and it
22 would also include anything that we need to do if
23 we have ballot stock that we need to do testing for
24 training as well.

1 Each sheet unfortunately costs 15
2 cents a piece. So total of the 320,000 sheet
3 purchase would be \$50,066.08.

4 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: That's with
5 shipping. Remind me. I know I asked this or a
6 similar question in the past. That which we do not
7 use, is it then -- because of the format or the
8 size or the age, is it not usable for future
9 elections?

10 MR. KELLY: We can use it every
11 election that we have as long as we have enough
12 stock ready.

13 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: They haven't
14 changed our system.

15 MR. KELLY: And we do keep our
16 ballot stock under DNR lock at all times. So some
17 of the inventory that we currently have was
18 purchased probably back in 2022. We have been
19 carrying over, but we just want to make sure we
20 have enough cushion as we go forward just in case
21 we would have another major election or two
22 sheets -- a two-sheet ballot.

23 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Okay.

24 MEMBER MARINELLO: Mr. Chairman, I

1 move the Board of Elections purchase 320,000 sheets
2 of ballot stock to use for the 2024 general
3 election from ES&S at a cost of \$50,066.08.

4 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Second the
5 motion.

6 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: It's been
7 properly moved and seconded. All of those in favor
8 of the motion signify by saying "aye."
9 (All members of the board voted unanimously by
10 saying aye.)

11 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: All opposed,
12 same sign.

13 Motion carries.

14 The next item on the agenda is the
15 purchase of envelope stock. I'll again turn that
16 over to Matt Kelly.

17 MR. KELLY: Well, once again, we are
18 checking our inventories and placing orders for
19 everything we need to do our absentee program.
20 That includes the purchase of envelopes. As you
21 may recall, we have three different envelopes we
22 use for absentee by mail.

23 We have an outer envelope that has
24 striping down the side, and it clearly states that

1 it's an official absentee ballot. Currently our
2 inventory is 184,000 of these pieces here.

3 Again, we would like to get that
4 inventory up to 300,000 in case we have a major run
5 on absentee ballots this year.

6 In 2020 we had -- during the middle
7 of the pandemic, we had 294,000 absentee voters.
8 While we don't expect that number this year, we
9 hope that a number of people who voted for the
10 first time absentee were happy with the service
11 they received, and they will to continue to vote
12 absentee. So we want to be ready for that;
13 however, we are not in the middle of a pandemic;
14 but we do anticipate 225,000 potential absentee
15 voters. It could be a little bit higher than that.
16 So inventory of 300,000 of these envelopes would be
17 appropriate for this election.

18 The second envelope is a return
19 envelope that goes inside the packet, and then the
20 last envelope is the identification envelope that
21 the voter must fill out and return.

22 All of these are included when the
23 absentee ballot goes out as one big packet. And so
24 to get us up to inventory of 300,000, we need to

1 order 125,000 of the outer envelopes. 100,000 of
2 the ballot return envelopes with the red stripe
3 down the side and 75,000 identification envelopes.
4 That would get our inventory up to 300,000 of each.

5 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Questions?

6 MEMBER FREEDHOFF: This is from a
7 different company than ES&S?

8 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Yes. This is a
9 local vendor up in Lewis Center.

10 MEMBER FREEDHOFF: Envelope
11 Solutions?

12 MR. KELLY: Envelope Solutions, yes.

13 MEMBER FREEDHOFF: Chairman, I move
14 that the board purchase 125,000 outer ballot
15 carrier envelopes. 100,000 ballot return
16 envelopes, and 75,000 ID envelopes from Envelope
17 Solutions for use in the 2024 General Election at
18 \$29,162.50.

19 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Second the
20 motion.

21 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: It's been
22 properly moved and seconded.

23 All of those in favor of the motion,
24 signify by saying "aye."

1 (All members of the board voted unanimously by
2 saying aye.)

3 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: All opposed,
4 same sign.

5 Motion carries.

6 The next item on the agenda is the
7 election administration plan. And each even
8 numbered year, the Ohio Secretary of State requires
9 each of the Board of Elections to make an election
10 administration plan.

11 MEMBER FREEDHOFF: Do you want me to
12 read this whole thing?

13 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: I'll turn
14 that over to Erin.

15 MS. GIBBONS: Board Members, before
16 you and in your email, you will find the regular
17 even year election administration plan for the 2024
18 November General Election as required by the Ohio
19 Secretary of State.

20 The election administration plan
21 details the election operations and contingency
22 plans of the board office as required by Ohio
23 Revised Code Section 161.09.

24 Any questions?

1 MEMBER MARINELLO: Were there many
2 changes from last years?

3 MS. GIBBONS: We actually had to do
4 one in the primary, and there weren't many changes
5 as we're using the same equipment as in the primary
6 election.

7 MEMBER MARINELLO: Awesome.

8 DIRECTOR WHITE: I want to just give
9 some kudos to Erin for putting this together. This
10 is a document -- actually our leadership team here
11 at the Board, our managers have been putting in
12 time on this. It's a large document. There's a
13 lot of requirements that we have, and Erin has done
14 a good job of putting this together.

15 In previous plans, the Ohio
16 Secretary of State has used that as an example with
17 other boards of what to do and how to do it. So
18 it's a document we're very proud of. We continue
19 to tweak it and make it better and improve it. I
20 want to thank Erin for her hard work.

21 MEMBER MARINELLO: Thank you.

22 MEMBER FREEDHOFF: Thank you.

23 MS. GIBBONS: Thank you.

24 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: We had a separate

1 meeting here not too long ago talking about
2 election communications. I'll keep those
3 conversations going to principally the same here,
4 which I didn't read this year; but I have gone over
5 with a fine tooth comb in recent years. Second
6 invasion of Normandy, put it all on paper; and then
7 you start and you put it on the shelf and hope you
8 don't need it. But good work.

9 MEMBER MARINELLO: I move that the
10 Board adopt the 2024 election administration plan
11 as provided by the BOE staff and required by the
12 Ohio Secretary of State.

13 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Second.

14 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: It's been
15 properly moved and seconded. All of those in favor
16 of the motion signify by saying "aye."

17 (All members of the board voted unanimously by
18 saying aye.)

19 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: All opposed,
20 same sign.

21 Motion carries.

22 The final item on the agenda is
23 hiring Josiah Lanning as an ADA coordinator and in
24 the PEO department as well.

1 Josiah has been with us for about a
2 year.

3 MR. LANNING: Almost a year.

4 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: And he
5 worked in the election support specialist program
6 and was instrumental in getting our candidates here
7 for the election support specialist program, and
8 weeding out those that didn't quite make the cut.
9 So we are appreciative of his efforts. We think
10 he's deserving of a full-time position here, and
11 with Josiah, we get an extra benefit as we get Kylo
12 as well.

13 MEMBER FREEDHOFF: I want to say
14 thank you for Josiah Lanning. I'm so thrilled.
15 I've heard nothing but good things about you for a
16 year, and I'm honored to have you as part of the
17 team full time.

18 So therefore -- any questions?

19 Therefore, Chairman, I move that the
20 Franklin County Board of Elections hire Josiah
21 Lanning as an ADA coordinator and EO department
22 clerk full-time position, June 3, 2024, at the rate
23 of \$20 per hour.

24 MEMBER MARINELLO: Second.

1 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: It's been
2 properly moved and seconded.

3 All of those in favor of the motion,
4 signify by saying "aye."

5 (All members of the board voted unanimously by
6 saying aye.)

7 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: All of
8 opposed, same sign.

9 Motion carries.

10 Congratulations.

11 MR. LANNING: Thank you.

12 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: I don't see
13 any other items on the agenda.

14 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Move to adjourn.

15 MEMBER MARINELLO: Second.

16 (Thereupon the meeting was concluded at 4:08 p.m.)

17

18

- - -

19

20

21

22

23

24

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

C E R T I F I C A T E

- - -

THE STATE OF OHIO:

SS:

COUNTY OF FRANKLIN:

I, Jeanine Fansler, Professional Reporter and Notary Public in and for the State of Ohio, do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true and accurate transcript of the proceedings hereinbefore set forth, as reported in stenotype by me and transcribed by me or under my supervision.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand and official seal of office at Columbus, Ohio, this 3rd day of August, 2024.

/s/Jeanine Fansler
Notary Public, State of Ohio

My Commission Expires: November 28, 2028.