

THE FRANKLIN COUNTY BOARD OF ELECTIONS

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

-- --

In Re: :

:
Regular Meeting. :

-- --

January 3, 2022

PROCEEDINGS OF

THE FRANKLIN COUNTY BOARD OF ELECTIONS

before Chairman Douglas J. Preisse, Deputy Director David Payne, and Board Members Kimberly E. Marinello, Michael Sexton, and Josh Jaffe, on Monday, January 3, 2022, beginning at approximately 3:06 p.m., and concluding at approximately 3:24 p.m.

-- --

Higgins & Associates
Court Reporting - Legal Video - Videoconference
4889 Sinclair Road, Suite 102
Columbus, Ohio 43229
**614.985.DEPO (3376) *888.244.1211*

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

APPEARANCES:

FRANKLIN COUNTY PROSECUTOR'S OFFICE
Jeanine Hummer, Esquire
Assistant Prosecuting Attorney
373 South High Street, 13th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215,

On behalf of the Board.

ALSO PRESENT:

Erin Gibbons
Matt Kelly

- - -

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

I N D E X

- - -

AGENDA ITEMS PAGE

| | |
|---|----|
| Approval of minutes | 4 |
| Audit Amendment of 11-2-21 General Election Results | 5 |
| E.E. Ward Contract Extension | 9 |
| Securitas Contract Extension | 11 |
| 2.75% Raise | 14 |
| Adjourn | 16 |

- - -

BOARD EXHIBITS:

| | |
|--|----|
| Exhibit A - List of full-time BOE employees | 15 |
|--|----|

- - -

Monday Afternoon Session
January 3, 2022
3:06 p.m.

- - -

DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: I will go
ahead and take roll.

Kim Marinello.

MEMBER MARINELLO: Here.

DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: Mike Sexton.

MEMBER SEXTON: Here.

DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: Doug
Preisse.

CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Here.

DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: And Josh
Jaffe.

MEMBER JAFFE: Yes.

DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: We have a
quorum.

The first item on the agenda is the
approval of the minutes from the November 1st and
November 19th meeting of the Franklin County Board
of Elections. I believe those were sent to you. I
don't know if anybody has any additions or
deletions or corrections.

MEMBER MARINELLO: I move that the

1 Board approve the minutes of the November 1, 2021
2 meeting and the November 19, 2021 meeting of the
3 Franklin County Board of Elections.

4 This is Kim Marinello.

5 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: And I second it.
6 Doug Preisse.

7 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: It's been
8 properly moved and seconded.

9 All those in favor of the motion
10 signify by saying aye.

11 (Vote taken.)

12 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: All opposed,
13 same sign.

14 (No response.)

15 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: Motion
16 carries.

17 The next item on the agenda is the
18 audit we performed for the November 2nd General
19 Election. And I'll turn that over to Matt Kelly to
20 do a report.

21 MR. KELLY: Good afternoon. This is
22 Matt Kelly.

23 On December 7th the Franklin County
24 Board of Elections conducted audits of the 2021
25 General Election as instructed by the Ohio

1 Secretary of State's office to all 88 county
2 boards. The audits conducted by Franklin County
3 were simple percentage-based audits done by
4 selecting just over five percent of total ballots
5 cast in the 2021 General Election from
6 randomly-selected voting locations or LIDs and the
7 precincts contained within those LIDs. The LIDs
8 chosen for these audits were randomly selected at
9 the November 19th Board meeting, as you remember.

10 The first portion of the audit
11 consisted of two countywide judicial races and the
12 second portion of the audit consisted of ballots
13 exclusively from the special 15th Congressional
14 District contest. All ballots in the audits were
15 reviewed by teams of sworn Board of Elections
16 employees paired up in bipartisan groups of four,
17 with each consisting of two Republicans and two
18 Democrats.

19 In the two countywide judicial races
20 a total of 10,285 ballots were audited representing
21 5.05 percent of all ballots cast in those races.
22 All 10,285 ballots selected for this audit were
23 reviewed and tallied by hand and then compared to
24 the official canvass results broken down by each
25 precinct. The audit in both judicial races

1 produced no ballot difference with no changes and
2 resulted in an overall accuracy rate of 100 percent
3 in both of those races.

4 In the 15th Congressional District
5 audit there were 4,885 ballots that were randomly
6 selected by the LIDs representing 5.74 percent of
7 all ballots cast in that race. All 4,885 ballots
8 were reviewed and tallied by hand and then also
9 compared to the official canvass results broken
10 down by precinct. This audit produced one ballot
11 difference where an absentee paper ballot was
12 marked in pencil, not pen as instructed, and the
13 lightly marked pencil image was captured by the
14 voting scanner machine as an undervote rather than
15 a vote for Candidate Mike Carey. This one vote
16 difference resulted in an overall accuracy rate of
17 99.98 percent. And the one vote difference and the
18 explanation was included in the audit report
19 submitted to the Ohio Secretary of State's office
20 at the conclusion of the audits.

21 Comprehensively between all results
22 of all three races in the audit, a total of 15,170
23 of those ballots that were reviewed, the overall
24 accuracy rate for Franklin County's post-election
25 audit was 99.997 percent, which is well above the

1 99.5 percent standard accuracy rate set forth by
2 the Ohio Secretary of State.

3 At this time the only action
4 required by the Board is to accept the contents
5 included in this report and the provided exhibits
6 reflecting the change of the one undervote to an
7 additional vote for Candidate Carey in the 15th
8 Congressional District election. And I ask for
9 your approval of this audit.

10 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: Any
11 questions?

12 MEMBER SEXTON: So we looked at
13 three races. I mean, that's one of them?

14 MR. KELLY: Right. We were required
15 to look at countywide races. So these are like the
16 two judicial countywide races because they were in
17 every precinct. There were no changes. That audit
18 was a hundred percent. In the 15th Congressional
19 District between Republican Carey and Democrat
20 Russo there was an undervote reported that should
21 have been a vote for Carey. That was because there
22 was an absentee mail-in ballot that had a pencil
23 bubbled in rather than an ink pen. So that
24 resulted in the machine viewing that vote as a
25 undervote. So that vote should have been assigned

1 to Republican Candidate Carey.

2 MEMBER SEXTON: So three races were
3 drawn and there was only a one vote change?

4 MR. KELLY: Correct. So the overall
5 rate is at 99.97 percent accuracy.

6 Other questions?

7 MEMBER SEXTON: Michael Sexton.

8 I move the Board amend and declare
9 as final the official canvass of the votes cast at
10 the November 2nd, 2021 General Election for the
11 15th Congressional District.

12 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Doug Preisse with
13 a second.

14 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: All those in
15 favor of the motion signify by saying aye.

16 (Vote taken.)

17 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: All opposed,
18 same sign.

19 (No response.)

20 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: Motion
21 carries.

22 The next item on the agenda is the
23 extension of the E.E. Ward contract. E.E. Ward is
24 the largest minority-owned company in the
25 country -- or the oldest, -- I'm sorry -- the

1 oldest minority-owned company in the country. And
2 we have used them for at least as long as I've been
3 here at the Board of Elections to move our voting
4 equipment to the 300-plus polling locations and
5 then retrieve those same voting machines and bring
6 them back to the Board of Elections. There is a
7 renewal up for this contract for the year 2022, and
8 the price would be the same. There would be no
9 change in anything with the contract. The amount
10 is not to exceed \$200,000 for delivery and pickup
11 of the voting machines to the polling locations and
12 then back to the Board of Elections.

13 Any questions regarding the E.E.
14 Ward contract or --

15 MEMBER SEXTON: We've used them for
16 years and years?

17 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: We've used
18 them for years and years with much success. It's
19 been a good partnership.

20 MEMBER JAFFE: This is for both the
21 primary and the general?

22 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: That is
23 correct, yes.

24 MEMBER JAFFE: Josh Jaffe. I move
25 the Board authorize the Director and Deputy

1 Director to enter into an annual trucking contract
2 extension with E.E. Ward in an amount not to exceed
3 \$200,000 for delivery and pickup of our voting
4 equipment in calendar years 2022.

5 MEMBER SEXTON: Michael Sexton.

6 Second.

7 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: David Payne.

8 It's been properly moved and seconded.

9 All those in favor of the motion
10 signify by saying aye.

11 (Vote taken.)

12 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: All opposed,
13 same sign.

14 (No response.)

15 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: Motion
16 carries.

17 The next item on the agenda is the
18 Securitas contract extension. As you probably
19 noticed, Securitas is our security firm that's in
20 the lobby. They secure not only the employees here
21 at the Franklin County Board of Elections, but as
22 well the voters that come to the Franklin County
23 Board of Elections and in addition they monitor and
24 control the building access in and out and have
25 done a great job for a number of years. There is

1 on this contract they -- Securitas is -- their
2 contract is collectively bargained. Last year the
3 security officers were making -- we were paying
4 \$20.76 an hour, and that would go up to \$25.31.
5 The site supervisor was making \$21.44 and that will
6 go up to \$29.33. I will say that the site
7 supervisor's contract is not collectively
8 bargained, but if we don't raise that rate the site
9 supervisor would be making less than the people he
10 supervises. So we would like to raise his as well.
11 I think the company, Securitas, would like us to
12 raise that as well. So it is an increase but they
13 have done a nice job for us and I think it's
14 warranted.

15 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: No questions
16 here.

17 MEMBER SEXTON: I just have a
18 question. Michael Sexton.

19 I'm just wondering if the other two
20 employees are receiving any kind of compensation
21 increase.

22 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: They are.
23 They would be considered the security officers who
24 would be going from \$20.76 an hour to \$25.31.

25 MEMBER SEXTON: Thank you.

1 MR. JAFFE: Josh Jaffe.

2 Do we know when the last time these
3 rates were changed?

4 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: I think each
5 year they change, but not this significantly, to be
6 honest with you. So yeah. I think each year we
7 raise the rates.

8 (Discussion off the record.)

9 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: This is
10 David Payne.

11 And just to give a encapsulation of
12 what Josh Jaffe was saying earlier, he was
13 indicating that this appeared to be a larger
14 increase than we normally have each year for the
15 Securitas contract. That is the case. We do
16 give -- we have been giving raises each year, but
17 this is significantly more. But it was
18 collectively bargained and that's the rate which we
19 were given. I think that basically summarizes what
20 Board Member Jaffe was saying.

21 MEMBER SEXTON: Michael Sexton.

22 I move that the Board authorize the
23 Director and Deputy Director to enter into an
24 annual security contract extension with Securitas,
25 as described, for security of the building and

1 employees at 1700 Morse Road, Columbus, Ohio, in
2 calendar year 2022.

3 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: This is Doug
4 Preisse with a second.

5 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: It's been
6 properly moved and seconded.

7 All those in favor of the motion
8 signify by saying aye.

9 (Vote taken.)

10 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: All opposed,
11 same sign.

12 (No response.)

13 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: Motion
14 carries.

15 The final item on the agenda is a
16 2.75 percent raise for employees, full-time
17 employees of the Franklin County Board of
18 Elections. This is something that typically is
19 given or authorized by the Franklin County
20 Commissioners each year. They had it come up as
21 well this year and authorized a 2.75 percent pay
22 increase for each the full-time employees at the
23 Board of Elections. What it would require, though,
24 is authorization by this Board in order to approve
25 that pay raise.

1 MR. JAFFE: This is Josh Jaffe.

2 Just to be clear, this is an
3 across-the-board cost of living pay increase to
4 every county full-time employee?

5 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: That is
6 correct.

7 MR. JAFFE: Okay.

8 (Discussion off the record.)

9 MR. JAFFE: This is Josh Jaffe.

10 I move that the Board approve a 2.75
11 percent pay increase to all full-time BOE staff for
12 calendar year 2022, as shown in Exhibit A.

13 MEMBER MARINELLO: Second. Kim
14 Marinello.

15 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: It's been
16 properly moved and seconded.

17 All those in favor of the motion
18 signify by saying aye.

19 (Vote taken.)

20 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: All opposed,
21 same sign.

22 (No response.)

23 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: Motion
24 carries.

25 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Are we doing

1 remote court reporting? This is a one-time thing?

2 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: I think this
3 is one-time thing because we learned that Carla
4 today had Covid symptoms. So she asked and we
5 thought it would be better that she not come here.

6 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: If we're going to
7 do it again, let's figure out the microphone in
8 front of us. What I know about technology is
9 nothing, but this wasn't ideal for her.

10 Thank you for hanging in there.

11 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Move to adjourn.

12 MEMBER SEXTON: Second.

13 - - -

14 Thereupon, the proceedings were
15 adjourned at approximately 3:24 p.m.

16 - - -

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

- - -

THE STATE OF OHIO:

SS:

COUNTY OF FRANKLIN:

I, Carla D. Castle, a Professional Reporter and Notary Public in and for the State of Ohio, do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, correct, and complete written transcript of the proceedings in this matter;

That the foregoing was taken by me stenographically and transcribed by me with computer-aided transcription;

That the foregoing occurred at the aforementioned time and place;

That I am not an attorney for or relative of any of the parties and have no interest whatsoever in the event of this matter.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand and official seal of office at Columbus, Ohio, this 17th day of January, 2022.

/s/Carla D. Castle
Notary Public, State of Ohio

My Commission Expires: September 29, 2026.

- - -

Exhibit A

| Employee # | Last Name | First Name | (2.75% Increase) | |
|------------|--------------|-------------|------------------|-----------------|
| | | | 2021 Hourly | 2022 New Hourly |
| 27287 | BECK | HEIDI | 19.6248 | 20.1645 |
| 55442 | BINDER | CHRISTOPHER | 25.2400 | 25.9341 |
| 17260 | BOZ | TERESA | 17.2842 | 17.7595 |
| 45811 | BUBUTIEV | JIM | 22.9008 | 23.5306 |
| 16761 | BULEN | STEPHEN | 36.2955 | 37.2936 |
| 5088 | COUNTS | KATHRYN | 30.9130 | 31.7631 |
| 50603 | FRANCIS | HANNAH | 16.1100 | 16.5530 |
| 29995 | FUHRMANN | MELLISSIA | 36.8447 | 37.8579 |
| 46017 | GALLIERS | BRAYDON | 20.4400 | 21.0021 |
| 18832 | GAMINO | ROLAND | 24.4939 | 25.1675 |
| 22692 | GATTON | LAURIE | 19.2500 | 19.7794 |
| 49173 | GATWOOD | JEFFREY | 49.0000 | 50.3475 |
| 55029 | GIBBONS | ERIN | 34.1300 | 35.0686 |
| 1480 | GILL | FRANK | 28.3748 | 29.1551 |
| 21086 | GOLDING | SETH | 23.8299 | 24.4852 |
| 22413 | HARRIS | PATRICK | 36.3008 | 37.2991 |
| 55650 | HART | JOSHUA | 16.1100 | 16.5530 |
| 28225 | HICKS | DEVYN | 16.1160 | 16.5592 |
| 19722 | JOHNSON | DEBORAH | 17.8614 | 18.3526 |
| 44374 | KELLY | MATTHEW | 35.2917 | 36.2622 |
| 20555 | LANDUYT | DENNIS | 37.3849 | 38.4130 |
| 15006 | LINK | ROBIN | 23.4300 | 24.0743 |
| 25616 | LOOS | STEVEN | 19.6287 | 20.1685 |
| 20998 | MACKEY | JEFFREY | 36.2955 | 37.2936 |
| 28745 | MALONE | MATTHEW | 20.4161 | 20.9775 |
| 48807 | MCREYNOLDS | KATRINA | 22.8400 | 23.4681 |
| 49211 | MILLER-GNANN | TARA | 15.5000 | 15.9263 |
| 24469 | MINGO | LANCE | 24.6019 | 25.2785 |
| 28221 | MITCHELL | TERRI | 16.1160 | 16.5592 |
| 26847 | NGUYEN | THU | 33.9844 | 34.9190 |
| 6930 | PATTON | CARLA | 36.2900 | 37.2880 |
| 26384 | PAYNE | DAVID | 66.3873 | 68.2130 |
| 10492 | PHAIPHANYA | SONNY | 27.3126 | 28.0637 |
| 12235 | RUSHAY | MATTHEW | 27.0065 | 27.7492 |
| 17780 | SELLERS | AARON | 34.2528 | 35.1948 |
| 19803 | SIMMONS | TRAVIS | 24.5000 | 25.1738 |
| 46086 | SLANE | ADAM | 26.5000 | 27.2288 |
| 45964 | TODD | DAVID | 16.3681 | 16.8182 |
| 6991 | TOMPKINS | MARY | 25.5946 | 26.2985 |
| 24032 | WADE | TANIA | 24.0201 | 24.6807 |
| 22620 | WALTER | KIMBERLY | 20.7848 | 21.3564 |
| 46016 | WHITE | ANTONE | 66.3873 | 68.2130 |
| 27380 | ZIEMBA | SARA | 25.0000 | 25.6875 |