

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

APPEARANCES:

FRANKLIN COUNTY PROSECUTOR'S OFFICE
By Timothy A. Lecklider, Esq.
Assistant Prosecuting Attorney
373 South High Street, 13th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215
(614) 525-3520,

On behalf of the Board.

Also present:

Thu Nguyen
Mel Fuhrmann
Steve Bulen

- - -

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

I N D E X

- - -

AGENDA ITEMS PAGE

Approval of Minutes of meeting held on 9-19-18 4

Voter Challenges: 12

Voter Challenge against Juana Evangelista Espada 21

Voter Challenge against Adrienne Claire White Hasty 22

Voter Challenge against Andre Ghee 22

2018 Employee Healthcare Contribution Rates 6

Legacy of Trainer Awards Dinner Resolution 8

Advertising Discussion 23

- - -

BOARD EXHIBITS IDENTIFIED

(None marked.)

- - -

1 Wednesday Afternoon Session
2 October 3, 2018
3 3:07 p.m.

4 - - -

5 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: We'll take
6 roll call.

7 Kim Marinello.

8 MEMBER MARINELLO: Here.

9 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: Mike Sexton.

10 MEMBER SEXTON: Here.

11 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: Doug
12 Preisse.

13 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Here.

14 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: And Brad
15 Sinnott.

16 MEMBER SINNOTT: Here.

17 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: We do indeed
18 have a quorum.

19 The first item on the agenda is the
20 approval of the September 19th, 2018, minutes from
21 the Franklin County Board of Elections. I believe
22 those were emailed to you last evening. I don't
23 know if you had an opportunity to look at those,
24 but --

25 MEMBER MARINELLO: I did. And I
move that the Board approve the minutes of the

1 Wednesday, September 19th, 2018, meeting of the
2 Franklin County Board of Elections as submitted.

3 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: Is there a
4 second?

5 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Second.

6 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: All those in
7 favor of the motion signify by saying aye.

8 (Vote taken.)

9 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: All opposed,
10 same sign.

11 (No response.)

12 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: The motion
13 carries.

14 The next three items on the agenda
15 are voter challenges. And I will turn that over to
16 Mel Fuhrmann, the manager of voter services, to
17 present.

18 DIRECTOR LEONARD: As I think about,
19 the items that don't really -- are not really of
20 issue, do we want to address those first to release
21 some of our staff that are waiting for --

22 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: I'll leave
23 that up to the Board.

24 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: That would be the
25 employee healthcare contribution and the legacy of

1 trainer awards?

2 DIRECTOR LEONARD: Right.

3 MEMBER SINNOTT: Did they all come
4 to lobby on some of the subjects?

5 DIRECTOR LEONARD: No. To provide
6 explanations.

7 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: I don't have a
8 problem with that. Let's do that.

9 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: Thu, you
10 want to start us off with the 2019 employee
11 healthcare contribution rates?

12 MS. NGUYEN: So the Franklin County
13 2019 healthcare plan begins January 1st, 2019,
14 through December 31st, 2019. Our agency needs to
15 confirm with the county benefits department the
16 employee contribution rate that we will be charging
17 for our agency for the year 2019. We don't operate
18 under the commissioners, but past practice has been
19 that we always follow the commissioners'
20 recommended employee contribution rates.

21 What you have in front of you is the
22 2019 year Board of Commissioners approved monthly
23 contribution rates. For employee only and employee
24 plus children the rate will increase from 136 to
25 \$140 per month. For employee plus spouse or

1 domestic partner and employee plus spouse or
2 domestic partner and children the rate will
3 increase from \$292 to \$312 per month. The rate
4 charged to the agency for each benefit-eligible
5 employee enrolled in healthcare will increase from
6 \$1,768 to \$1,848 per month. And the rate charged
7 to the agency for each benefit-eligible employee
8 that is not enrolled in healthcare coverage will
9 increase from \$27.28 to \$33 per month.

10 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Good report, Thu.

11 MEMBER SINNOTT: Yes, it was.

12 DIRECTOR LEONARD: And we did ask
13 whether or not we could prevent those increases to
14 our board members, but that didn't fly.

15 MEMBER SINNOTT: Nor should it.

16 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: Any
17 questions?

18 DIRECTOR LEONARD: This is fairly
19 standard practice on the part of the Board to adopt
20 the commissioners' recommendation.

21 MEMBER SEXTON: I would move that
22 the Board approve the employee healthcare
23 contribution rates as passed by the Board of
24 Commissioners of \$140 per month for employees
25 without a spouse/partner and \$312 per month for

1 employees with a spouse/partner.

2 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: Is there a
3 second?

4 MEMBER SINNOTT: There is.

5 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: All those in
6 favor of the motion signify by saying aye.

7 (Vote taken.)

8 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: All opposed,
9 same sign.

10 (No response.)

11 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: The motion
12 carries.

13 The next item is the Legacy of
14 Trainer Awards dinner resolution. We have had --
15 and I'll defer to Steve Bulen, but this would be
16 the fourth annual legacy of trainers award banquet.
17 And it's been what I would consider a huge success.
18 I know that Kim has been to those. The Director
19 and I always attend those. A lot of staff --

20 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: You do that here?

21 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: We do that
22 here. And they make our room look like a ballroom.
23 I mean, it's very nice, very well done, we cater
24 food. Anytime we have food catered or spend money
25 or recommend spending money, it requires a

1 resolution from the Board in order to do it.

2 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: All right.

3 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: Steve, I
4 think I kind of just stole your thunder, but --

5 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: See if you can
6 improve on that.

7 MR. BULEN: Mr. Chairman, good to
8 see everyone. It is a great event. It's a night
9 of celebration not only for trainers but also we
10 recognize certain poll workers and members of the
11 community and based on, you know, maybe some extra
12 special things that took place for that election.
13 And it is a really great evening. And I just want
14 to personally invite all of you out.

15 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Who gets invited
16 to this?

17 MR. BULEN: Our trainers. And then
18 we do select certain poll workers that maybe have a
19 special occasion taking place for that year or
20 something that we want to recognize them for. We
21 recognize members of our community that have
22 participated in different programs with our poll
23 workers. Last time it was our prep students
24 program for those from Dublin City Schools. The
25 students with disabilities that served as poll

1 workers, we recognized the leader of that group and
2 she came out and we gave her an award.

3 DIRECTOR LEONARD: We recognized
4 Dr. Marsh --

5 MR. BULEN: Dr. Marsh.

6 DIRECTOR LEONARD: -- who recently
7 passed, but was one of our long-time poll workers.

8 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Does the staff
9 here all get invited?

10 MR. BULEN: Managers and then we've
11 even recognized staff members who have been here
12 for several years to celebrate their longevity.

13 MEMBER SINNOTT: Steve, how many
14 attend?

15 MR. BULEN: I would say overall 50
16 to 60 folks.

17 MEMBER MARINELLO: It's a very nice
18 event.

19 MR. BULEN: Thank you.

20 DIRECTOR LEONARD: We like to
21 recognize them just because they train the people
22 who are the frontline. Voters never see us. They
23 see our poll workers, and they're the ones who are
24 basically the Board of Elections to the community
25 and it's these folks who train and get them ready

1 for that job.

2 MEMBER SINNOTT: Does it really cost
3 us \$2,500 to do the dinner for 50 or 60?

4 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: It doesn't,
5 but we allocate that it's to not exceed it.

6 MEMBER SINNOTT: What does it
7 actually cost?

8 DIRECTOR LEONARD: Do you recall?

9 MR. BULEN: I know at least from one
10 to two thousand. It doesn't go over 2,500 for
11 sure. That includes awards, the meal, decorations.

12 MEMBER MARINELLO: Yeah. Those were
13 nice awards. Well deserved too.

14 MEMBER SINNOTT: It winds up being
15 actually somewhere -- something that starts with a
16 one and not a two, it sounds like. Is that
17 correct?

18 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: I don't want
19 to just -- I think so.

20 MEMBER MARINELLO: Things go up
21 every year.

22 MEMBER SINNOTT: I move that the
23 Board accept the resolution authorizing the staff
24 to hold a Legacy of Trainer Awards dinner on
25 Tuesday, November 27, 2018, at the Franklin County

1 Board of Elections and the Board also authorizes
2 that the cost of the Legacy of Trainers dinner will
3 not exceed the amount of \$2,500.

4 MEMBER MARINELLO: Second.

5 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: All those in
6 favor of the motion signify by saying aye.

7 (Vote taken.)

8 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: All opposed,
9 same sign.

10 (No response.)

11 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: The motion
12 carries.

13 I think we can go back now to the
14 voter challenges. So Mel, come on down.

15 MS. FUHRMANN: Good afternoon,
16 members of the Board. My name is Melissa Fuhrmann.
17 I'm the manager of the voter services division.

18 Just to give you some historical
19 context as to how I think these challenges came
20 about. At the beginning of September Secretary of
21 State Husted sent out absentee applications to all
22 registered voters in the state of Ohio. As a
23 result, my division received an influx of phone
24 calls from a number of folks in Columbus and
25 Franklin County saying that other folks did not

1 reside at their address.

2 We sent out challenge forms to those
3 voters who requested them. And I currently have
4 three challenge forms in front of me, and you
5 should have the three challenge forms as well. My
6 hope is that you also have Section 1.14, Challenge
7 of Right to Vote, which is from the Ohio Election
8 Officials Manual.

9 So I'm going to take each one of
10 these three in turn, starting with the challenge
11 from voter Bridget Thomas challenging the right to
12 vote of Andre Ghee. It should be file stamped
13 September 18th of 2018.

14 As you can see, on the challenge
15 form Miss Thomas states that she doesn't know the
16 person, she doesn't know Mr. Ghee, he does not
17 reside at her address, and she does not want
18 Mr. Ghee voting using her particular address, which
19 is the 2543 Bulen Avenue address.

20 Attached you will find the
21 registration of Miss Thomas. She is, in fact, an
22 active voter in our system. You will also find
23 attached what we have on record as registrations
24 for Mr. Andre Ghee. The printed registration is
25 from the Bureau of Motor Vehicles.

1 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: What do you mean
2 the "printed" one?

3 MS. FUHRMANN: The one --

4 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Oh. The one that
5 was filled out by --

6 MS. FUHRMANN: Correct.

7 It shows the address of 2546 Bulen
8 Avenue; but if you look at the registration on the
9 last page, you will see someone by the name of Dre
10 Dre who we have reason to believe is the same
11 person or is purported to be the same person as
12 Mr. Andre Ghee.

13 Now, there is one caveat, important
14 caveat, to understanding this situation. And the
15 handwritten registration that is filled out by a
16 Mr. Dre Dre was submitted to us in 2015 by an
17 organization by the name of Strategy Network. The
18 historical context here is that there were problems
19 with this organization submitting fraudulent
20 registrations and we had reason to believe that
21 this was one such registration.

22 For example, if you compare it with
23 the previous registration from the BMV, you'll see
24 that the last four digits of the Social do not
25 match exactly even though the date of birth does

1 match. It was a common practice with these
2 fraudulent registrations to have an ID that might
3 be off by one or two digits.

4 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Where's the last
5 four digits of the Social?

6 MEMBER MARINELLO: You mean the
7 driver's license?

8 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: You mean the
9 driver's license?

10 MS. FUHRMANN: Yeah. It's box
11 number ten.

12 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Oh, I see. Got
13 you.

14 MS. FUHRMANN: You can see a
15 difference there between 0524 and 4524. That was a
16 common practice historically to have the Social
17 Security number off by one digit, to have some
18 different form of the voter's name.

19 So the upshot of what I'm saying
20 here is that we have two registrations here from
21 Mr. Ghee. The BMV one is probably legit; the
22 handwritten one is probably not.

23 MEMBER MARINELLO: I think he signed
24 it Dr. Dre, it looks like.

25 MS. FUHRMANN: And we sent that to

1 our pending batch and sent out a letter. Never got
2 anything back for Mr. Dre. Also, by way of
3 information, our records show that Mr. Ghee has
4 never voted.

5 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: What was the
6 organization again and what was their --

7 MS. FUHRMANN: Their name was
8 Strategy Network. They were active in the year
9 2015. And my colleague, Alicia Healy, tells me
10 that this was a common practice, to submit
11 fraudulent registrations that looked a lot --

12 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: What did they
13 exist for? What were they purportedly --

14 MS. FUHRMANN: They were a
15 canvassing organization. It was their business to
16 go out and collect voter registrations, is my
17 understanding.

18 MEMBER SINNOTT: I think what is
19 common about all three of these challenges is that
20 the Secretary sent the absentee ballot request
21 form.

22 MS. FUHRMANN: Yes.

23 MEMBER SINNOTT: Your section was
24 then contacted by the three challengers saying the
25 person to whom the Secretary's message was

1 addressed did not reside --

2 MS. FUHRMANN: Correct.

3 MEMBER SINNOTT: -- with the
4 challenger.

5 MS. FUHRMANN: That's right.

6 MEMBER SINNOTT: So then you said,
7 All right, we'll send you out a challenge form.

8 MS. FUHRMANN: That's right.

9 MEMBER SINNOTT: These challenge
10 forms were completed and sent back to us.

11 MS. FUHRMANN: Yes, sir.

12 MEMBER SINNOTT: Then your section
13 issued a letter to the challenged voter.

14 MS. FUHRMANN: Correct, at their
15 last known address.

16 MEMBER SINNOTT: And were those all
17 three returned by the postal service?

18 MS. FUHRMANN: They were not.

19 MEMBER SINNOTT: Okay. They weren't
20 returned.

21 But you've heard nothing from the
22 challenged voter as of the present?

23 MS. FUHRMANN: That's right.

24 MEMBER SINNOTT: And what is the
25 status that we assign to a voter who has been

1 successfully challenged? Is that immediate removal
2 from the rolls?

3 MS. FUHRMANN: We -- If -- That's
4 right. Our recommendation in voter services, based
5 on the research that we did in all three of these
6 instances, would be that the challenged voter be
7 removed if that is what the Board votes to do.

8 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: So what happens?

9 DIRECTOR LEONARD: It would be put
10 in a canceled status.

11 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: For our
12 electronic records we check the canceled box?

13 DIRECTOR LEONARD: Right. That's my
14 understanding. It's canceled.

15 MS. FUHRMANN: That's right.

16 MEMBER SINNOTT: So if that person
17 then shows up to vote in November, he or she is
18 told you're not a registered voter?

19 MS. FUHRMANN: That's correct.

20 MEMBER SINNOTT: Got it. Thank you.

21 MEMBER MARINELLO: Or they can vote
22 provisionally.

23 MS. FUHRMANN: They could. They
24 could vote. I mean, the voter always has the
25 option to vote provisionally.

1 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: You have one case
2 where it appears somebody did live at that address
3 but moved five years ago.

4 MS. FUHRMANN: Correct.

5 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: And evidently
6 hasn't attempted to update in this case her
7 registration.

8 MS. FUHRMANN: We always check the
9 challenged voter. We always check their voter
10 history. And in the case of Mr. Ghee, he's never
11 voted.

12 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: And in the case
13 of is Miss Hasty?

14 MS. FUHRMANN: In the case of
15 Miss Hasty, she hasn't voted since 2012, which I
16 believe predates her registration of 2013.

17 And in the case of Miss Espada, she
18 has never voted and never updated her address.

19 DIRECTOR LEONARD: Correct me if I'm
20 wrong, Mel or Alicia. But if the individual is in
21 a canceled status and they vote a provisional, they
22 can vote provisional but that provisional won't be
23 counted because they are canceled. That
24 provisional would serve as a new registration for
25 that individual, but because they're in a

1 canceled -- their voter status has been canceled a
2 provisional ballot cast by a canceled voter
3 wouldn't be counted.

4 MEMBER MARINELLO: There's not a
5 separate area of pending or like you could look
6 back and say --

7 DIRECTOR LEONARD: When we had the
8 Urbancrest voters last year, we did put them in a
9 provisional status so that they could vote a
10 provisional ballot. I forget how we corrected it.

11 MEMBER SINNOTT: That was a special
12 case.

13 DIRECTOR LEONARD: Yes.

14 MEMBER SINNOTT: All right. We
15 should probably do these one at a time.

16 MS. FUHRMANN: Would you like to
17 start with Mr. Ghee?

18 MEMBER SINNOTT: I think --

19 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: You want to
20 do them one at a time?

21 MEMBER SINNOTT: Yeah, let's do them
22 one at a time.

23 MEMBER MICHAEL SEXTON: Starting
24 with Bridget Thomas or --

25 MEMBER SINNOTT: She's the

1 challenger, Rebecca Smith. Bridget Thomas, she's
2 connected with Mr. Ghee. Rebecca Smith is the
3 challenger and Espada is the challenged voter.

4 MEMBER SEXTON: I move that the
5 Board approve the challenge of the right to vote
6 filed by Rebecca Smith, 1228 Rand Avenue, Columbus,
7 Ohio, against Juana Evangelista Espada of the same
8 address and order that Juana Evangelista Espada's
9 registration be removed from the Franklin County
10 BOE.

11 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Second.

12 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: All those in
13 favor of the motion signify by saying aye.

14 (Vote taken.)

15 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: All opposed,
16 same sign.

17 (No response.)

18 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: The motion
19 carries.

20 MEMBER MARINELLO: And Thomas Miller
21 is the same situation?

22 MS. FUHRMANN: Right.

23 Adrienne Hasty has not voted since
24 2012. It appears from our records that she simply
25 hasn't updated her registration address.

1 MEMBER MARINELLO: I move that the
2 Board approve the challenge of the right to vote
3 filed by Thomas Howard Miller, 42 Nadine Place
4 South in Westerville against Adrienne Claire White
5 Hasty of the same address and order that Adrienne
6 Claire White Hasty's registration be removed from
7 the Franklin County Board of Elections voter file.

8 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Second.

9 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: All those in
10 favor of the motion signify by saying aye.

11 (Vote taken.)

12 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: All opposed,
13 same sign.

14 (No response.)

15 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: The motion
16 carries.

17 MEMBER SINNOTT: I move that the
18 Board approve the challenge of right to vote filed
19 by Bridget Thomas, 2543 Bulen Avenue, Columbus,
20 Ohio, against Andre Ghee of the same address and
21 order that Andre Ghee's registration be removed
22 from the Franklin County Board of Elections voter
23 file.

24 MEMBER MARINELLO: Second.

25 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: All those in

1 favor of the motion signify by saying aye.

2 (Vote taken.)

3 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: All opposed,
4 same sign.

5 (No response.)

6 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: The motion
7 carries.

8 The final item --

9 Thank you, Mel.

10 MS. FUHRMANN: Thank you very much.

11 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: The final
12 item on the agenda is a discussion of advertising.
13 Aaron Sellers put together a communications plan
14 that he has followed. Some of these items have
15 already transpired, but those are earned media.
16 The idea today was to discuss a paid media plan or
17 expenditure. There is an advertising budget of
18 \$245,000 and a remaining \$30,000 for consultants if
19 the Board chooses to utilize that available money.

20 MEMBER SINNOTT: Okay. In 2017 I
21 don't believe we advertised that there was going to
22 be an election.

23 DIRECTOR LEONARD: Correct. I don't
24 believe the Commissioners gave us a budget for
25 advertising. We did it in '14 and did it in '16.

1 MEMBER SINNOTT: Do you have any
2 idea of what's true about Hamilton County and
3 Cuyahoga County in terms of what they spend
4 advertising when there's going to be election?

5 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: Hamilton
6 County doesn't spend anything. Cuyahoga County I
7 think spends \$110,000 for a mailing.

8 MEMBER SINNOTT: They do a mailing
9 to every voter saying there's going to be an
10 election?

11 DIRECTOR LEONARD: Yes. Right.
12 Voting location, ID, early vote information. More
13 a voter information card that they send, but it
14 also includes the voter's voting location.

15 We looked at it here, but the
16 challenge was it was just a tight time frame now.
17 We would utilize our print shop, and at this point
18 in time our print shop's whole focus is on printing
19 our ballots and all the other activities that we
20 have for them.

21 MEMBER SINNOTT: That also seems
22 redundant of the message that every voter in Ohio
23 received from the Secretary just this time last
24 month.

25 DIRECTOR LEONARD: Uh-huh.

1 MEMBER SINNOTT: We talked about
2 this from time to time in the past, and here's my
3 perspective on this. In 2018 the people of central
4 Ohio are going to be barraged by tens of millions
5 of dollars of advertising pointing out that there's
6 going to be an election the first Tuesday of
7 November. And the amount that has been budgeted
8 for this is something close to five times the
9 average household income in our community. It's
10 also true that all 8 million Ohio voters within the
11 last month received from the Secretary of State's
12 office a flyer that could be used to request an
13 absentee ballot. And I checked this just today.
14 Along with that Secretary's mailing, there's notice
15 that you have an opportunity to vote from home, to
16 vote early in person, or to vote on election day.

17 I have a hard time justifying
18 spending \$250,000 in taxpayer money advertising
19 there's going to be a November 6th election against
20 that background. And what's more, I believe that
21 when Ed and David last went to a commissioners'
22 meeting when this subject was discussed, that is
23 expenditures by the Board of Elections, the county
24 commissioners were understandably pointing to the
25 many demands on county budget including fighting

1 the opioid epidemic in our community, building a
2 new jail. Franklin County is under a lot of
3 financial pressure right now. So if we can save
4 the taxpayers of Franklin County a quarter of a
5 million dollars by not advertising that there's
6 going to be a November 6th election, in light of
7 all the information about that subject that people
8 in central Ohio are going to receive, I think we
9 ought to do it. I think that's good public
10 service.

11 MEMBER MARINELLO: I disagree. As
12 you said yourself, you get a lot of fliers in the
13 mail. They are just bombarded with them. I think
14 they get -- not a lot of people look at them, you
15 know, but they do look at TV. I mean, they just
16 get so much now and they probably get sick of it
17 and throw it away.

18 DIRECTOR LEONARD: And the ad will
19 be similar to what it was in the past in terms of a
20 focus on early vote and absentee by mail so that we
21 could take the pressure off the polls on election
22 day.

23 MEMBER SINNOTT: I looked at it
24 yesterday. It's an animated spot and I thought it
25 was well done as animated advertising. The problem

1 is that it costs a quarter of a million dollars to
2 air the spot under this budget. And by the time
3 the November 6th election is drawing near, there's
4 not going to be anyone in the community who is left
5 unaware of the fact there's going to be a November
6 election. We truly are going to be at the focal
7 point with tens of millions of dollars of
8 advertising related to that particular election.
9 This is not a small amount of money. And sometimes
10 those of us in government lose sight of the value
11 of the taxpayer dollar. We are talking about an
12 amount that is pretty close to five times the
13 average household income in Franklin County.

14 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Let me ask a
15 question and make a comment maybe. This is the --
16 Was this a self mailer? Is that how this was --
17 This is the Secretary of State.

18 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: It was in an
19 envelope.

20 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: That's just a
21 part of it?

22 MEMBER SINNOTT: Yeah. It's a part
23 of the package that the Secretary of State sent
24 out.

25 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: And it went to

1 all voters in Ohio, but all registered Franklin
2 County voters.

3 MEMBER SINNOTT: Yeah. I think the
4 number is close --

5 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: 868,429 is here
6 as the document suggests to us.

7 And if a voter has moved in recent
8 times, the voter will have received -- I mean, if
9 they --

10 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: We would
11 send them a postcard telling them of their new
12 polling location.

13 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Okay. And if we
14 change precincts and their polling location was
15 changed but they haven't moved, they would also get
16 a postcard?

17 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: Correct.

18 DIRECTOR LEONARD: And I know the
19 voting location card would contain information
20 about early vote, and we just made that change so
21 that it would contain information about early vote
22 and voter ID.

23 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: And the Secretary
24 of State's mailing also describes voting from home,
25 voting early in person, or voting on election day.

1 I don't remember getting that in home. No. I did
2 see that, but I put it aside.

3 MEMBER SEXTON: So the question I
4 have is it says here that the paid media plan may
5 include TV time. Is this consistent with what
6 we've done in the past in terms of do we just do
7 TV, do we do other things in terms of print?

8 DIRECTOR LEONARD: The past
9 expenditures in '14 and '16 did include a component
10 of print advertising as well as --

11 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: -- TV,
12 radio, newspaper, digital.

13 DIRECTOR LEONARD: And this would
14 include some digital component of it as well.

15 MEMBER SEXTON: So this would
16 include TV time, print --

17 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: I think --
18 Board Member Sexton, I think the reason it said
19 media plan may include TV time was because that's
20 kind of what we discussed, Ed and I discussed.

21 DIRECTOR LEONARD: Right.

22 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: I actually think
23 if we thought a voter didn't know when the election
24 was it would be an off year, not an on year.

25 MEMBER SEXTON: So in 2014 do we

1 know how much we spent on it?

2 DIRECTOR LEONARD: I think you have
3 those, David.

4 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: \$658,819.

5 MEMBER SEXTON: And in 2016 what did
6 we spend?

7 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: What did we
8 have? I think it was 265,000 plus 60,000 for the
9 consultants.

10 MEMBER SEXTON: So 265 and 60.
11 \$325,000?

12 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: Uh-huh.

13 MEMBER SEXTON: And the plan before
14 today calls for 245 plus 30, so that's 275, which
15 is significantly lower than 2014 for the same type
16 of election.

17 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: I think we have a
18 question or a comment from a loyal member of the
19 public. And I'm inclined to say please identify
20 yourself, for the record.

21 MS. WOODS: My name is Mary Woods.
22 I come to most of these meetings. So I moved last
23 year, changed address, got my postcard. I also got
24 the mail from the Secretary of State's office,
25 which I looked at very closely. So I'm going to

1 ask you, is that the one that was mailed to you?
2 And did he send them out to all 88 counties with
3 the address of the early vote center? Because that
4 would obviously be different for all 88 counties,
5 and I would guess a lot of people who see ads on TV
6 could not tell you where the early vote center is.
7 And having a daughter and a son and a
8 daughter-in-law who are voting location managers, I
9 can tell you that they were overwhelmed on election
10 day in '16 and that the more people who come and
11 vote early the more efficient our elections will be
12 in Franklin County. So if that doesn't have the
13 address of the early vote center in Franklin
14 County, then it isn't really giving all the
15 information we need for voters to have.

16 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Anybody else want
17 to say anything that's here?

18 I'll note that there is -- in the
19 voter early person section there's a website you
20 can vote and a suggestion you can contact your
21 county board of elections.

22 MEMBER SEXTON: I would say to the
23 Director, what is the time frame for the
24 advertising? When would it -- The 245,000, whether
25 it be in --

1 DIRECTOR LEONARD: The last time we
2 did it it began the day before early vote started
3 and ran for eight days at that point. So to apply
4 that same, it would start on October 9th and then
5 run eight days, which would be the middle of the
6 following week. Because the focus of advertising
7 would be on getting people to either go to the
8 early vote center, inform them about the location
9 of the early vote center, or encouraging them to
10 request an absentee application either by calling
11 the Board of Elections or going online.

12 And obviously, the closer we get, we
13 don't want to -- we want to get that message out as
14 early as possible because the closer you get to the
15 election the harder it is to turn that around. So
16 we want people requesting early. That's why the
17 advertising is run early in the cycle. So we think
18 it would be a consistent time frame that we would
19 use this year.

20 MEMBER SEXTON: So that would be
21 roughly October 9th to October 17th?

22 DIRECTOR LEONARD: Sounds about
23 right, yeah.

24 MEMBER SEXTON: For any kind of
25 print advertising or digital things that you

1 mentioned, what would the time frame for that be?

2 DIRECTOR LEONARD: Same time frame.

3 Just do it as early as possible so that we can get
4 the maximum impact out of those. Because, again,
5 if you advertise the last -- many of those print
6 publications are going to be weeklies, and so the
7 closer you get to the election the more you're
8 hitting -- you're contacting that person right
9 close to the deadline. So the advertising would be
10 earlier in the process.

11 MEMBER SINNOTT: Do we do
12 advertising in the daily newspaper?

13 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: The
14 advertising that we're required to do, notifying of
15 the election and the ballot and that type of thing,
16 we do.

17 DIRECTOR LEONARD: There would be a
18 component of that print that would be advertisement
19 in the daily paper, but also digital advertisement
20 on the Dispatch website as well. So there would be
21 some component of that that would be digital for
22 our daily publications web page.

23 MEMBER SINNOTT: But we're going to
24 do a Dispatch advertisement one or the other.
25 That's statutorily required, I think.

1 DIRECTOR LEONARD: Right. But some
2 of that is just more the technical advertisement
3 that we're required to do.

4 MEMBER SEXTON: Is that advertising
5 in this budget?

6 DIRECTOR LEONARD: That would be
7 part of the 245. We don't have it broken down.
8 The recommended breakdown when we spoke to
9 Mr. Spicer about it was 200,000 on TV, 30 on radio,
10 and 15 on print and digital.

11 MEMBER SEXTON: Sorry. You said
12 200,000 on TV and 30 on radio?

13 DIRECTOR LEONARD: And the remainder
14 on print and digital.

15 MEMBER MARINELLO: Did we actually
16 have the waving signs before? Are those the big
17 things that wave?

18 DIRECTOR LEONARD: Yeah. Those are
19 the big arching waving signs.

20 MEMBER MARINELLO: We haven't had
21 those before, have we?

22 DIRECTOR LEONARD: We've had them in
23 '16 I believe.

24 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: Well, I
25 think we've had our advertising discussion.

1 Anybody want to discuss it any more at this point?

2 MEMBER SINNOTT: I thought it was a
3 good discussion. And let's move to the Board to
4 get perspectives.

5 MEMBER SEXTON: Well, if we don't
6 act on this today, it's pretty much not going to
7 happen before the election. I think we should take
8 a look at acting on it.

9 DIRECTOR LEONARD: The time it would
10 take to re-edit the TV ad would be at least five
11 days, to re-edit the TV ad to include the current
12 date. So some action needs to be taken today if
13 we're going to be able to move forward because we
14 don't have any other scheduled meetings.

15 MEMBER SINNOTT: This appeared as a
16 discussion-only item. Have we given public notice
17 of this as an action item?

18 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: No. I
19 mean --

20 DIRECTOR LEONARD: This is a
21 reschedule. It's a rescheduled regular meeting.

22 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: I said -- I
23 had it as a discussion.

24 DIRECTOR LEONARD: Okay. I -- I
25 know you wanted to have some discussion on it, but

1 I thought there would be some decision on it.

2 MEMBER SINNOTT: Doesn't sound to me
3 as though there's any consensus.

4 MEMBER SEXTON: Well, I'm --

5 MEMBER SINNOTT: Somebody could make
6 a motion and test that.

7 MEMBER SEXTON: I mean, I would be
8 willing to make the motion that this Board approve
9 up to \$245,000 for the paid media plan and TV time,
10 an additional \$30,000 for the consultants as laid
11 out for the purpose of advertising.

12 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: Is there a
13 second?

14 MEMBER MARINELLO: I'll second.

15 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: All those in
16 favor --

17 MEMBER SINNOTT: Wait. Wait. Now
18 that there's been a motion and second, we should
19 have some additional discussion of the Board
20 members wants. And my view remains that we ought
21 not be spending \$275,000 of the taxpayers money to
22 advertise that there's going to be an early
23 November election. So I'm opposed to the motion.

24 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Yeah. I'd just
25 reiterate what you said, what we all know to be

1 true, there's going to be tens of millions of
2 dollars spent in central Ohio on TV, over the
3 airwaves, radio, mailings from many many sources,
4 and the media is going to just by nature of the
5 election cycle be reporting on the upcoming
6 election and has been ad nauseam. So I would add
7 that to the discussion. And I think we need a roll
8 call.

9 MEMBER MARINELLO: Well, the
10 important part is early vote center and that's not
11 really out there, you know.

12 MEMBER SEXTON: I would just also
13 add that it's my understanding that we're talking
14 about the commissioners, that the commissioners
15 have approved this for this Board to spend --

16 DIRECTOR LEONARD: Right.

17 MEMBER SEXTON: -- on advertising as
18 well as this Board -- I was not a member of at the
19 time -- appears to have a history every two years.
20 In 2014 they spent \$658,000, in 2016 \$325,000. And
21 this is 2018 and it's significantly lower than that
22 and it's within the realm of what we've been
23 budgeted by the commissioners.

24 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: One of the
25 things that Board Member Sinnott said that kind of

1 made me think was when we did meet with the county
2 commissioners about our voting machines and our
3 need for voting machines they indicated, I mean,
4 basically you've got the \$10.3 million to use that
5 the state allocated and we're looking now at
6 potentially \$12 million that we need. You know, I
7 really didn't think of that until now. But I know
8 that money that's budgeted may not be held over but
9 at least it's a -- an argument that, Hey, we're
10 watching our pennies. Again, I --

11 DIRECTOR LEONARD: But again, the
12 comments that were made by Miss Woods is that it
13 does take a lot of stress off by encouraging people
14 to vote at the early vote center and vote absentee.
15 It does take that pressure off our polling
16 locations on election day by encouraging as many
17 people as possible. And it seems like we've seen
18 the value of it because we've had a growing number
19 of people who take advantage of the early vote
20 center and the -- and absentee by mail.

21 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: My final remarks
22 would be that I think that's because in-person
23 early voting is now part of the accepted culture
24 and understood process of an election year.

25 MEMBER SINNOTT: Well, let's call

1 the question.

2 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: All those in
3 favor of the motion signify by saying aye.

4 MEMBER SINNOTT: Let's do a roll
5 call.

6 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: There's been
7 a motion and second.

8 Kim Marinello.

9 MEMBER MARINELLO: Yes.

10 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: Michael
11 Sexton.

12 MEMBER SEXTON: Yes.

13 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: Doug
14 Preisse.

15 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: No.

16 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: And Brad
17 Sinnott.

18 MEMBER SINNOTT: No.

19 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: Okay.

20 That's a 2-2 vote. I don't know that that's
21 something that goes to the Secretary of State, but
22 I --

23 DIRECTOR LEONARD: We'll have to
24 inquire of that as to whether this is a subject
25 matter the Secretary of State is going to weigh in

1 on.

2 MEMBER SINNOTT: It doesn't sound
3 like it's something the Secretary is going to
4 intervene on. Nonetheless, that's where we are.

5 I move we adjourn.

6 CHAIRMAN PREISSE: Second.

7 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: All those in
8 favor signify by saying aye.

9 (Vote taken.)

10 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: All opposed,
11 same sign.

12 (No response.)

13 DEPUTY DIRECTOR PAYNE: The motion
14 carries.

15 - - -

16 Thereupon, the proceedings were
17 adjourned at approximately 3:50 p.m.

18 - - -

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

- - -

THE STATE OF OHIO:

SS:

COUNTY OF FRANKLIN:

I, Carla D. Castle, a Professional Reporter and Notary Public in and for the State of Ohio, do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, correct, and complete written transcript of the proceedings in this matter;

That the foregoing was taken by me stenographically and transcribed by me with computer-aided transcription;

That the foregoing occurred at the aforementioned time and place;

That I am not an attorney for or relative of any of the parties and have no interest whatsoever in the event of this matter.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand and official seal of office at Columbus, Ohio, this 23rd day of October, 2018.

/s/Carla D. Castle
Notary Public, State of Ohio

My Commission Expires: September 29, 2021.

- - -