

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

APPEARANCES:

Franklin County Prosecutor's Office
By Mr. Tim Lecklider
Assistant Prosecuting Attorney
373 South High Street, 13th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215

On behalf of the Board.

ALSO PRESENT:

Ms. Suzanne Brown,
Executive Assistant to the Board

Mr. Jeffrey Mackey,
Manager, Election Operations
Franklin County Board of Elections

Ms. Carla Patton,
Franklin County Board of Elections.

- - -

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

INDEX

- - -

ITEM	PAGE
Certification of Candidate Petitions	4
Denial of Certification of Candidate Petitions	8
Certification of Local Questions and Issues	36
Denial of Certification of Local Issue	38
E.E. Ward Moving & Storage Company Contract Renewal	39
Authorization of Purchase of Forklift	42
Adjourn	43

- - -

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

- - - - -

P R O C E E D I N G S

- - -

DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Good afternoon, everyone. I call the Franklin County Board of Elections Special Meeting to order.

Gregory Haas.

MR. HAAS: Here.

DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Douglas Preisse.

MR. PREISSE: Here.

DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Bradley Sinnott.

MR. SINNOTT: Here.

DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Mr. Chairman, we have a quorum.

And the first item on the agenda would be to certify to the May 5 Primary Election ballot and the November 3, 2015, General Election ballot, those candidates appearing on what you have here as Exhibit A, and Jeff Mackey can go through that for you guys.

Jeff.

MR. MACKEY: Exhibit A has two sections. The first couple pages are candidates to be certified for the Primary Election and the last couple are candidates that will be certified through to the

1 General Election because no primary was necessary
2 either by statute or because there weren't sufficient
3 candidates filing to warrant such a primary.

4 MR. SINNOTT: So Exhibit A is the staff
5 recommendation for everybody that is qualified for
6 the ballot?

7 MR. MACKEY: Correct.

8 MR. SINNOTT: Just out of curiosity, why
9 are the Reynoldsburg offices split up on the roster?
10 We have some offices that began appearing on
11 page 2 and run onto page 3, and then there's a break
12 and we have no Reynoldsburg offices till the fifth,
13 sixth page.

14 MR. MACKEY: The only offices that had
15 enough candidates to warrant a Primary Election were
16 the Republican ballots for city attorney, two
17 candidates; president of council, two candidates; and
18 then Wards 1, 2, and 4, so it necessitated a Primary
19 Election there.

20 MR. SINNOTT: First there's the listing
21 of the candidates who would be involved in a primary?

22 MR. MACKEY: Correct.

23 MR. SINNOTT: After that is the listing
24 of candidates who would not be involved in a primary?

1 MR. MACKEY: Correct.

2 MR. WALCH: If there weren't enough
3 candidates to trigger a primary, they go straight
4 through to the November election, or in the case of
5 Franklin County Municipal Court, there is no primary
6 for those, so those candidates go straight through to
7 the General Election.

8 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Jeff, on page 6 you
9 have Reynoldsburg Ward 2 and Reynoldsburg Ward 3 full
10 term as going to the May primary. I apologize. I
11 didn't number the pages. It's the next-to-last page.
12 Well, it is the last page, front side of the last
13 page, May 5, Exhibit A, Reynoldsburg 2, Mark
14 McKenzie, Democrat, and --

15 MR. MACKEY: I apologize, the header
16 didn't change.

17 MR. WALCH: Yes, the header didn't
18 change. The last three pages should all be
19 candidates going through to the November General
20 Election.

21 Is that correct, Jeff?

22 MR. MACKEY: Yes.

23 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: I wanted to make sure.

24 MR. WALCH: The header didn't change.

1 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: That should be for the
2 page preceding that as well, right, for the judges?

3 MR. MACKEY: Right.

4 MR. WALCH: Beginning with judge for the
5 municipal court with Bill Pollitt and continuing back
6 those are all for the General Election.

7 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: I just wanted to ask
8 about that. I got you. Just wanted to make sure.

9 MR. PREISSE: Good catch.

10 MR. WALCH: Good catch.

11 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: I didn't catch it.
12 Our attorney caught it.

13 How do you want to proceed with this?

14 MR. PREISSE: Well, I think we caught one
15 glitch there. I don't have any questions.

16 MR. SINNOTT: I think we are ready for a
17 motion. Are we in agreement that we are altering
18 Exhibit A such that on the last three pages of the
19 exhibit it will read "Candidate petitions recommended
20 for Board certification to the November 3, 2015,
21 General Election." Did I say that correctly?

22 MR. MACKEY: Yes.

23 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Yes.

24 MR. SINNOTT: Now that we have altered

1 Exhibit A in the fashion just indicated, I move that
 2 the Board certify the May 5, 2015, Primary Election
 3 ballot and the November 3, 2015, General Election
 4 ballot those candidates appearing on Exhibit A whose
 5 petitions were found to be valid and sufficient.

6 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Is there a second?

7 MR. HAAS: Second.

8 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: All those in favor?

9 (Vote taken; motion passed.)

10 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: That motion carries.

11 Jeff, Exhibit B.

12 MR. MACKEY: Exhibit B has five projects
 13 to be found either insufficient or invalid.

14 MR. SINNOTT: The explanation here as to
 15 why the staff thinks these candidates should be
 16 excluded from the ballot?

17 MR. MACKEY: Correct.

18 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: And we have before us
 19 Exhibit B containing the names of Columbus Mayor,
 20 James Ragland; member of council, Doyline Williams;
 21 Board of Education, Johannes Christian; member of
 22 council, Hilliard, Robert Stepp; member of council,
 23 David Nixon, Whitehall.

24 I think it's been our tradition -- it has

1 been our tradition to allow would-be candidates or
2 counsel or representative to address the Board if
3 they wish to do so.

4 Any of the aforementioned candidates or
5 representatives in the audience would like to --

6 Yes, sir, in the middle.

7 MR. MACKEY: Mr. Christian.

8 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Mr. Christian, would
9 you state your name and address for the
10 stenographer's record.

11 DR. CHRISTIAN: Sure. My name is
12 Johannes Christian. My address is 750 West Rich
13 Street, Apartment 102, Columbus, Ohio, 43222.

14 MR. PREISSE: Thank you. And I have a
15 note that we have listed here the condition of your
16 filing late, filed after the 4:00 p.m. statutory
17 deadline February 4, 2015. I take it you would like
18 to address the Board, sir.

19 DR. CHRISTIAN: I would like to address
20 the Board. I entered the room where the petitions
21 were to be filed before 4:00 o'clock. I stood in
22 what I thought was the line only to determine after
23 standing there that the group of people were people
24 that were coming out of a meeting and not people in

1 line.

2 By the time I got to the counter, it was
3 4:03. I was told at that time that my petition would
4 not be accepted, that I could file it, but that it
5 was after the filing time.

6 So I'm asking that you would reconsider
7 that because I really was in the building before the
8 time of the filing deadline.

9 MR. PREISSE: I happened to be in the
10 room, too, and I remember seeing you enter the very
11 room of filing after 4:00 o'clock. You're suggesting
12 you were in the building before --

13 DR. CHRISTIAN: No. I'm suggesting I was
14 in the room before 4:00 o'clock, not in the building,
15 not only in the building.

16 MR. PREISSE: Okay. That, sir, does not
17 comport with my memory, but it has been known to be
18 faulty in the past.

19 Are there any other Board members that
20 want to discuss this?

21 DR. CHRISTIAN: I'm sorry. I don't know
22 who you are, but if you would say your name.

23 MR. PREISSE: Yes. I am Doug Preisse,
24 one of the Board members. Doug Preisse.

1 MR. SINNOTT: Dr. Christian, I'm Brad
2 Sinnott, one of the Board members, and I, too, was in
3 the room right at 4:00 o'clock and remember your
4 entry. But would you please tell us what it is you
5 did upon arriving at the Board? I know there were a
6 number of people in the front of the Board's office
7 that day.

8 DR. CHRISTIAN: That's where we stood
9 waiting because we thought that was the line, and I
10 indicated in the letter I handed to the Board, one of
11 my committee members after we had stood there asked
12 if the people that were standing there were waiting
13 to approach the counter, and that's when we were told
14 that they were not, and when I got to the counter, it
15 was then 4:03.

16 MR. SINNOTT: Mr. Christian, there's a
17 letter here dated February 17, and it looks to be the
18 one that you submitted. May we take a moment to read
19 your letter? I have not seen it before now.

20 MR. PREISSE: We are going to read the
21 letter here for a few moments.

22 DR. CHRISTIAN: That's fine. Thank you.

23 MR. HAAS: Dr. Christian, my name is Greg
24 Haas, one of the Board members, and I want to ask our

1 attorney a question. In terms of the Revised Code,
2 what does it say about being in the room, being there
3 versus having it time-stamped? At what point are we
4 obligated to follow the Revised Code in terms of the
5 acknowledgment? Is there specific language?

6 MR. LECKLIDER: The specific language,
7 Board Member Haas, is that the petitions must be
8 filed no later than 4:00 p.m. on the date of the
9 deadline.

10 MR. HAAS: Must be filed.

11 MR. WALCH: It's 3513.05 of the Revised
12 Code. It does specifically list 4:00 p.m., the
13 90th day before the primary, which was February 4 in
14 this case. That's all it details.

15 MR. SINNOTT: And the petitions were
16 actually tendered at 4:03, Mr. Mackey?

17 MR. MACKEY: We date-stamped them at
18 4:04.

19 DR. CHRISTIAN: If I can address the
20 Board, the time that I was given by the young lady
21 who took my petition when she came to greet me, she
22 said it was 4:03. I don't know since you were in the
23 room if any of you-all heard the conversation or not.

24 MR. WALCH: Dr. Christian, this is Dana

1 Walch. I'm the deputy director of the Board of
2 Elections. I was in the room when this came in, and
3 I do recall both Mr. Mackey and I stating that it was
4 4:00 o'clock by our time-stamped mechanisms that we
5 have, and I don't remember you being in the room at
6 that time.

7 Just for the members of the Board, that's
8 my recollection of the situation. I did see your car
9 pull up. I believe it was a van, if I remember
10 correctly, did pull up right near the 4:00 o'clock
11 deadline, right when we announced that it was
12 4:00 o'clock, and the time was up is when I recollect
13 seeing your vehicle pull up outside. Just for the
14 members of the Board, that is my recollection of the
15 situation as I was in the room.

16 DR. CHRISTIAN: I don't want to be in
17 opposition of the Board. I only stand here because I
18 feel like the information I gave you in that letter
19 was true and correct. I don't know that I could get
20 from a van inside of the room to have stood there and
21 got to your desk by 4:03 with my physical condition,
22 but I will take your word. All I'm asking is that
23 you reconsider.

24 MR. SINNOTT: Thank you, Dr. Christian.

1 Is there anyone here today with you that
2 was with you on filing day, February 4?

3 DR. CHRISTIAN: Yes. Pastor Randolph is
4 standing to my left.

5 MR. SINNOTT: Pastor Randolph, you have
6 the benefit of sight, I believe. What was it that
7 you saw as you approached the file counter that
8 prompted you to think there was a line?

9 PASTOR RANDOLPH: There was a group of
10 four or five people on the right, and the same on the
11 left. I got with the people on my left, and we
12 carried on a little conversation. Then I questioned
13 that group, "Are you standing in line?" And they
14 said no.

15 So then we went and proceeded to the
16 counter, and the lady informed us that we had missed
17 the deadline, and she explained it to us.

18 DR. CHRISTIAN: What time did she give
19 us?

20 PASTOR RANDOLPH: She said, I will say
21 you were here at 4:03. I was kidding her. I said,
22 "Well, you took an hour and a half to explain it,"
23 just kidding her, but she did take some time to
24 explain the process to us.

1 MR. HAAS: Dr. Christian, I very much
2 understand what you're saying about three minutes
3 from the van to get to where you got to. Clearly,
4 there's really no difference between 4:03 and 4:04 in
5 the end.

6 I think this is one that we need to learn
7 from to make sure that when we have people who might
8 be sight impaired or handicapped in any way, they
9 know where to be and make sure we have things well
10 marked. If it is in our discretion, I would ask my
11 fellow Board members to consider allowing
12 Dr. Christian to be on the ballot.

13 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Is that in the form of
14 a motion --

15 MR. WALCH: Do you want the members of
16 the Board -- if I might, Mr. Haas, we did not go
17 through the exercise of checking these signatures on
18 this petition, which has been our past practice, that
19 if a petition does appear to have a fatal flaw to it,
20 that we don't. I mean, obviously, we've got to check
21 a lot of petitions when they come in in a short
22 amount of time, so if one in the past has what we
23 perceived as a fatal flaw, we did not go through the
24 exercise of checking the actual petitions to it.

1 I would think -- I would want Bill's
2 perspective on this also and certainly counsel. I
3 think that the Board could potentially do a -- if it
4 was your decision to certify the candidate, sort of
5 pending verification of the number of signatures to
6 make sure that the signatures did meet the minimum
7 qualifications --

8 MR. HAAS: Absolutely, right.

9 MR. WALCH: -- of the office because
10 today is the deadline on the certification or
11 noncertification to the ballot. I think the Board
12 could probably do that. I would ask Bill his opinion
13 and certainly counsel also. I would think you could
14 do that.

15 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Then we would have to
16 have another meeting if the signatures are all valid.

17 MR. PREISSE: That they are invalid?

18 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: If they were valid.

19 MR. SINNOTT: Could we certify the
20 candidate to the ballot upon the condition that there
21 be a sufficient number of valid signatures confirmed?
22 That would seem to me to be a possibility.

23 MR. WALCH: I would think if you were
24 going to do that, if you are going to make a motion

1 to certify him, I would think that's the only way we
2 could possibly do it because we do have deadlines in
3 place for any protests that any candidate might want
4 to file, and to try to hold this back until such time
5 as we might be able to get the Board together again
6 could start to impede upon that protest deadline also
7 that is in statute. That is the only thing that I
8 would say to the Board.

9 MR. HAAS: I will word the motion so that
10 it is pending -- that we allow Dr. Christian's
11 petitions to be accepted and to place him on the
12 ballot pending the certification of the signatures
13 submitted.

14 MR. SINNOTT: And under these unique
15 circumstances about which I happen to have personal
16 knowledge, I would second that motion.

17 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: It has been properly
18 moved and seconded.

19 Discussion.

20 MR. PREISSE: I was there, too, and saw
21 that we had a crowd of people waiting around, and
22 given the extraordinary circumstances of
23 Dr. Christian's sight -- and we're delighted you came
24 before us today, and let's see if this works.

1 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Any other discussion?

2 All those in favor say aye.

3 (Vote taken; motion passed.)

4 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Motion carries.

5 MR. PREISSE: Thank you, Dr. Christian.

6 MR. WALCH: We can have these petitions
7 checked first thing tomorrow morning. It should not
8 take us that long to do that.

9 DR. CHRISTIAN: Thank you so much.

10 MR. MACKEY: Mr. Ragland also wished to
11 address the Board.

12 MR. PREISSE: Okay.

13 MR. RAGLAND: Good afternoon, members of
14 the Board.

15 MR. PREISSE: Would you state your name
16 and address for the record.

17 MR. RAGLAND: Yes, sir. My name is James
18 Ragland. I live at 3784 Conway Drive, Columbus, Ohio
19 43227.

20 MR. PREISSE: We note here in Exhibit B
21 that the staff includes the description of your
22 candidate deficiency as, "Nominating committee did
23 not contain the names of five registered electors in
24 the city of Columbus."

1 MR. RAGLAND: Yes, sir. I have an
2 elector that has two homes. One is in a Canal
3 Winchester 43110 address that is suitable to be an
4 elector. He lives at that address and has lived at
5 that address for a while. I have documentation of
6 bills paid from that address as well, and I'd like to
7 bring him on. He has all of that documentation with
8 him.

9 MR. PREISSE: He is here?

10 MR. RAGLAND: Yes, sir.

11 MR. PREISSE: And wishes to address the
12 Board?

13 MR. RAGLAND: Yes, sir. His name is
14 Dorian Wingard. From my understanding he was the
15 elector in question.

16 MR. PREISSE: I wonder if we could
17 have -- have the director or deputy director describe
18 to us a little bit of the circumstances here. Then
19 we can have -- I forget the last name already.

20 MR. RAGLAND: Wingard.

21 MR. PREISSE: Then Mr. Wingard address
22 us.

23 MR. WALCH: It did come to our attention
24 that on Mr. Ragland's nominating petition one of the

1 members of his so-called Committee of Five,
2 Mr. Wingard, gave an address that was on Gallatin
3 Way, which is actually an address in the Village of
4 Obetz in Hamilton Township.

5 Upon us finding out that information, we
6 did send it over to the City Attorney, as it is a
7 matter of the Columbus City Charter regarding that,
8 and it was their opinion at that time that that could
9 be seen as a fatal flaw to the petition, which is why
10 Mr. Ragland's name is on Exhibit B.

11 On Thursday of last week, February 12,
12 Mr. Wingard did switch his registration to 4106 Coble
13 Bowman Way, which is a Canal Winchester mailing
14 address, but it is in the city of Columbus. I
15 believe it is Ward 86, if my memory serves me
16 correctly, which is an address that he had been
17 registered at back in 2010. He has been at the
18 Gallatin Way address since October of 2010 and has
19 voted at that address through 2014. That's what I
20 have.

21 MR. SINNOTT: Okay. I want to make sure
22 what the issue is before we hear some facts about it.
23 When was the petition created?

24 MR. WALCH: The signature on the

1 nominating petition was January 16, 2015.

2 MR. SINNOTT: It's filed when?

3 MR. WALCH: Was it filed on February 4?

4 MR. MACKEY: Yes, February 4.

5 MR. WALCH: I couldn't remember the exact
6 day, but right at the filing deadline of February 4.

7 MR. SINNOTT: And the address for
8 Mr. Wingard that was of record at the Board of
9 Elections during that time would have been an Obetz
10 address?

11 MR. WALCH: That is correct.

12 MR. SINNOTT: And that is the reason that
13 the staff proposed exclusion of Mr. Ragland from the
14 ballot.

15 MR. WALCH: That's correct.

16 MR. SINNOTT: That's the one and only
17 reason that he wouldn't make the ballot?

18 MR. WALCH: We did not -- again, upon
19 hearing that this could be a fatal flaw to the
20 petition, we did not go through and check the
21 signatures. He did file with 2,521 signatures on his
22 petition. I don't know that he -- we don't know that
23 he met the signature requirement threshold of 1,000
24 ballot signatures because it's been our practice in

1 the past that if we have envisioned there being a
2 fatal flaw to a petition, again, in the same
3 rationale as the last candidate, we don't go through
4 and check the signatures on that one. But that was
5 the reason for not moving forward.

6 MR. SINNOTT: That was the same situation
7 as Dr. Christian a moment ago?

8 MR. WALCH: That's correct.

9 MR. SINNOTT: Mr. Ragland, did you say
10 Mr. Wingard was actually a resident of Columbus in
11 January and February of this year?

12 MR. RAGLAND: Yes, sir. Well, the
13 address that is in the Obetz precinct is a Columbus
14 43207 address, but he lives in a Canal Winchester
15 address that is in a Columbus precinct, 43110, so
16 essentially on the page it says Gallatin, Columbus,
17 Ohio 43207, and he lives at a Canal Winchester
18 address.

19 MR. SINNOTT: There's no dispute about
20 the Gallatin address being in the municipality of
21 Obetz, though, correct?

22 MR. RAGLAND: Yes, sir.

23 MR. SINNOTT: That's the Board's
24 understanding as well.

1 MR. WALCH: That's correct.

2 MR. SINNOTT: It is your understanding,
3 Mr. Ragland, Mr. Wingard was residing in the city of
4 Columbus in Canal Winchester in February of this
5 year?

6 MR. RAGLAND: Yes, sir, prior to that.

7 MR. PREISSE: And there is also no
8 dispute that address is a Columbus precinct?

9 MR. WALCH: That's correct.

10 MR. PREISSE: We will hear from
11 Mr. Wingard, please.

12 MR. WINGARD: Good afternoon, gentlemen.

13 MR. PREISSE: Please state your name and
14 address.

15 MR. WINGARD: Dorian, D-O-R-I-A-N,
16 Wingard, W-I-N-G-A-R-D. The address is 4106 Coble
17 Bowman Way, Canal Winchester, 43110.

18 MR. PREISSE: Okay. Talk to us about it.

19 MR. WINGARD: This is one of those things
20 that should not have happened. I have been back at
21 the Coble Bowman Way address since the second week of
22 November, the 14th. I have been active at the
23 Gallatin Drive address while taking care of my mother
24 and grandmother. Recently my other sibling had began

1 to take on some of those duties, so I was actually
2 backing my way out of it and had done so as of
3 November 14.

4 And that day when we were dealing with or
5 signing off on the petitions, I was dealing with some
6 things at the house and that was at the fore of my
7 head that I had to take care, and I inadvertently put
8 my address there. My intention fully was to list my
9 Columbus, Ohio, address in Canal Winchester, the 4106
10 Coble Bowman Way address, and that is my intent
11 today, is to clarify that point.

12 MR. SINNOTT: Mr. Wingard, I'm going to
13 try to summarize what you just told me, and correct
14 me if I say anything that is wrong.

15 The second week of November, 2014, you
16 changed your residence from the Gallatin to the Coble
17 Bowman house.

18 MR. WINGARD: What I did, I went back to
19 my home, which has been my primary address. I had
20 been going back and forth taking care of the family
21 matter, so it was roughly around the second, third
22 week of November when I went ahead and transplanted
23 fully back because I was going to have my other
24 sibling come in and take care of the things that I

1 was taking care of.

2 MR. SINNOTT: But it's the second week of
3 November where this change takes place?

4 MR. WINGARD: Yes, sir.

5 MR. SINNOTT: When you say you changed
6 your residence, what in your day-to-day life changed
7 in the second week of November?

8 MR. WINGARD: What in my day-to-day life
9 changed?

10 MR. SINNOTT: Yes.

11 MR. WINGARD: Where I laid my head, where
12 I spent a little bit more time, and, exactly, that my
13 primary residence became the 4106 Coble Bowman Way.

14 MR. SINNOTT: As of the second week of
15 November, you started waking up in the morning
16 ordinarily on Coble Bowman?

17 MR. WINGARD: Yes, sir.

18 MR. SINNOTT: And when you would go home
19 at night, you would go home to Coble Bowman?

20 MR. WINGARD: I would go take care of
21 what I needed to take care of and ultimately end up
22 there.

23 MR. SINNOTT: Where were you conducting
24 your personal business, from which location?

1 MR. WINGARD: Personal business in terms
2 of?

3 MR. SINNOTT: The businesses that you
4 have transactions with, when they would contact you,
5 at which residence would they be contacting you?

6 MR. WINGARD: They would contact me at
7 that residence.

8 MR. SINNOTT: Which one?

9 MR. WINGARD: The Coble Bowman. Like I
10 said, I've been transferring everything back to that
11 address. When it comes up, my driver's license is
12 not up until '17, 2017, so when that happens, it will
13 transfer itself back. Renewing passports, all those
14 kinds of things are being transferred back to that
15 address as they come up.

16 MR. PREISSE: Are you getting mail at
17 that address?

18 MR. WINGARD: Yes, sir.

19 MR. SINNOTT: Have you always received
20 mail at the Coble Bowman address?

21 MR. WINGARD: The bulk of my mail, yes.
22 But as I began to take on some of the other
23 responsibilities at the Gallatin Road address,
24 spending more time there to take care of family, some

1 of the other ones came there. But I don't have any
2 utilities there at that house in my name. All of my
3 primary expenses are at the Coble Bowman address.

4 MR. PREISSE: That's where you get your
5 utility bills?

6 MR. WINGARD: Yes, sir.

7 MR. SINNOTT: You know, I believe that
8 you have been one of the owners of the Coble Bowman
9 house for a number of years, right?

10 MR. WINGARD: Yes, sir.

11 MR. SINNOTT: Who is the other owner?

12 MR. WINGARD: By name, you want that on
13 the record?

14 MR. SINNOTT: Yes, her name.

15 MR. WINGARD: Ms. Saunders, Kimberly
16 Saunders.

17 MR. SINNOTT: But there was some point in
18 the past when you began spending most of your time
19 and you began residing at the Gallatin Road address,
20 correct?

21 MR. WINGARD: I began spending time
22 there, yes.

23 MR. SINNOTT: When was that by the
24 calendar?

1 MR. WINGARD: By the calendar, that was a
2 few years ago, roughly the latter part of 2010 and
3 maybe '11. As relationships go, you know, things
4 happen, will happen, and that's what took place
5 there.

6 MR. SINNOTT: Understand.

7 MR. WALCH: We have his registration
8 switching from Coble Bowman Way to Gallatin Way in
9 October of 2010, which would be the only record we
10 have which is his voter registration.

11 MR. SINNOTT: There's an elderly family
12 member at Gallatin way?

13 MR. WINGARD: She would probably take
14 offense to the term "elderly," but my mother is
15 there, and now it is compounded by a terminal illness
16 that my grandmother has, so we are dealing with a lot
17 of that at the house.

18 MR. SINNOTT: And your mother and
19 grandmother reside at the Gallatin Way address?

20 MR. WINGARD: Mother does. My
21 grandmother is back and forth between Oberlin, Ohio,
22 and Columbus, Ohio for testing at OSU.

23 MR. SINNOTT: Did you vote in the 2014
24 election?

1 MR. WINGARD: Yes, sir.

2 MR. SINNOTT: Did you vote from the
3 Gallatin Way?

4 MR. WINGARD: Yes, sir.

5 MR. SINNOTT: You're telling us that the
6 week after that you changed your residence back to
7 Coble Bowman?

8 MR. WINGARD: Roughly a week, ten days.
9 And that month was also marked with transition in a
10 lot of other ways in terms of starting new employment
11 and a lot of other things segued into being able to
12 make that transition.

13 MR. SINNOTT: You've been continuously
14 registered to vote in Franklin County for how long a
15 period of time?

16 MR. WINGARD: Eighteen years old.

17 MR. SINNOTT: You're a citizen of the
18 United States?

19 MR. WINGARD: Yes, sir.

20 MR. SINNOTT: You're more than 18 years
21 old yourself?

22 MR. WINGARD: Even though I don't look
23 it, yes, sir.

24 MR. SINNOTT: You have been a resident of

1 the state of Ohio for more than 30 days?

2 MR. WINGARD: For 44 years, yes, sir.

3 MR. SINNOTT: We know you have been a
4 resident of Franklin County for years and you have
5 been registered to vote in Franklin County for years,
6 correct?

7 MR. WINGARD: Yes, sir.

8 MR. PREISSE: Those sound like
9 qualifications to be an elector. There's something
10 about being incarcerated, but you're obviously not
11 that because you're here today.

12 MR. WINGARD: No, sir, I'm not
13 incarcerated. I'm here, you're right.

14 MR. SINNOTT: Under these
15 circumstances -- and I'll ask Bill and Dana this.
16 Under these circumstances if Mr. Wingard were to
17 report to the Coble Bowman polling place in the May
18 primary and say I have been residing at Coble Bowman,
19 even though I don't have an updated address at the
20 Board of Elections, would he be allowed to cast a
21 provisional ballot?

22 MR. WALCH: Yes.

23 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Yes.

24 MR. PREISSE: He would be considered a

1 city of Columbus elector and be permitted to vote?

2 MR. WALCH: If he presented himself as
3 such at the May primary, yes.

4 MR. SINNOTT: And unless the Board came
5 into information or evidence indicating that what
6 Mr. Wingard represented about himself and where he
7 lived was untrue, not only would he be allowed to
8 cast a provisional ballot, you would count his
9 provisional ballot; is that correct?

10 MR. WALCH: If everything were filled out
11 correctly and he was in the right polling location,
12 et cetera, yes.

13 MR. MACKEY: I don't know if this is
14 material or not. We did also, as Dana mentioned
15 earlier, receive his updated voter registration card.
16 In the scenario you were putting forth, he would
17 actually not be a provisional voter.

18 MR. SINNOTT: Because of the filing of
19 the recent address update?

20 MR. MACKEY: Correct.

21 MR. WALCH: Yes. Now he is in the books
22 at 4106 Coble Bowman Way.

23 MR. HAAS: Is there anyone here from the
24 City Attorney's office who would like to speak on any

1 kind of interpretation of the charter?

2 You had a chance to review the charter on
3 this, its wording on what constitutes a committee
4 member?

5 MR. LECKLIDER: I apologize, I don't --

6 MR. HAAS: That's why I asked if there
7 was anybody from the City Attorney's office or
8 anybody else that would want to speak about what the
9 exact wording in the charter is that the City
10 Attorney referred to.

11 MR. WALCH: I do have it.

12 MR. SINNOTT: Although I don't sit on the
13 Board to practice law, I do have handy this charter
14 provision and the statute of being an elector. The
15 charter provision in question is this. This a
16 description of what is a valid nominating petition:
17 "Such petitions shall contain the names and addresses
18 of five registered electors of the city of Columbus
19 designated in advance by the candidate as an
20 nominating committee." That's what the charter says.

21 Then the statute on the qualifications of
22 an elector says, "Every citizen of the United States
23 who is of the age of 18 years or over and who has
24 been a resident of the state 30 days immediately

1 preceding the election at which the citizen offers to
2 vote is a resident of the county and precinct in
3 which the citizen offers to vote, and has been
4 registered to vote for 30 days, has the
5 qualifications of an elector and may vote at all
6 elections in the precinct in which the citizen
7 resides."

8 Let me make a motion so that there can be
9 Board discussion. I move, subject to the condition
10 of the Board staff determination of a sufficient
11 number of valid signatures that John Ragland be
12 certified --

13 MR. RAGLAND: Excuse me, sir, my name is
14 James.

15 MR. SINNOTT: Forgive me -- that James
16 Ragland be certified to the primary ballot for the
17 office of Columbus mayor.

18 MR. PREISSE: I'd second it.

19 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Discussion.

20 MR. PREISSE: Now we talk about it.

21 MR. SINNOTT: I mean, given -- the reason
22 I made the motion, given what we've heard today, I
23 don't see how Mr. Wingard is not a Columbus elector
24 qualified to serve on Mr. Ragland's nominating

1 committee, and, therefore, I favor giving ballot
2 access to Mr. Ragland. I think he's entitled to it.

3 MR. PREISSE: Well, what catches my
4 attention is that this Board and our policies and the
5 law would have considered him prior to the
6 registration update an eligible voter in his Columbus
7 precinct, which means he was that, in my mind, at the
8 time of the creation of the petition.

9 If the timing of what you're telling us
10 is accurate I believe he was principally back at the
11 Columbus address.

12 MR. WINGARD: Yes, sir.

13 MR. HAAS: My only concern in this that
14 we really haven't -- I mean, I know there's the
15 excerpt that you read from the charter and identified
16 it, but you certainly didn't represent yourself as an
17 attorney for the city of Columbus and the charter
18 today, and I'm a little uncomfortable about the idea
19 that we may not have had at the point the petitions
20 were circulated a full committee, but I haven't heard
21 anything to suggest that other than the attorney's
22 first consideration there was a fatal flaw, but that
23 was before Mr. Wingard had changed his voting
24 location, which he's allowed to do, and having heard

1 nothing that says that's a fatal flaw, then I have to
2 agree.

3 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Any more discussion?

4 All those in favor say aye.

5 (Vote taken; motion passed.)

6 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Motion carries.

7 MR. RAGLAND: Thank you.

8 MR. WINGARD: Thank you.

9 MR. HAAS: The motion, again, we have to
10 restate, make sure everybody understands, is subject
11 to the correct signatures.

12 MR. SINNOTT: Right.

13 MR. WALCH: That's correct, the same as
14 with Dr. Christian in the previous.

15 MR. PREISSE: Any other candidates or
16 representatives of candidates who will be recommended
17 for noncertification today in the audience?

18 Doesn't look like there are any.

19 MR. HAAS: I'll make the motion that
20 candidates listed on Exhibit B, excluding James
21 Ragland for Columbus mayor and Dr. Johannes Christian
22 for Columbus Board of Education, excluding those two,
23 I move that we accept the employees' decision that we
24 strike the remaining three candidates.

1 MR. SINNOTT: Second.

2 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: All those in favor say
3 aye.

4 (Vote taken; motion passed.)

5 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Motion carries.

6 The next item on the agenda would be the
7 certification of the issues and local questions.

8 MS. PATTON: This election we have a
9 total of six subdivisions filed for tax levies on the
10 ballot, and then we also had a total of 13 local
11 option petition filings. However, for the primary,
12 we are recommending that six tax levies be certified
13 to the ballot as well as nine of the local option
14 petitions that were filed be certified to the Primary
15 Election.

16 Because of the fact that candidates must
17 appear on the primary ballot in order for a local
18 option to appear, we are recommending that the
19 Madison D filing and the Westerville 3A local option
20 filings both be certified to the General Election
21 ballot.

22 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Any questions?

23 MR. WALCH: These issues all have been
24 run through counsel at the prosecutor's office to

1 make sure they are properly filed and the language is
2 correct and sufficient.

3 MS. PATTON: The number of signatures
4 filed were sufficient and found to be valid. We did
5 check with Liquor Control. They all do have
6 applications on file as required by Ohio Revised Code
7 as well.

8 MR. PREISSE: One was for a renewal and
9 decrease. You don't see that very often.

10 MR. WALCH: That's why, as Carla said,
11 the three Madison, two in Madison D and one in
12 Westerville 3A, are put straight through to the
13 General Election ballot. That's why it is listed out
14 in Exhibit C the way it is because there were no
15 candidates in those jurisdictions and, thus, state
16 law does not allow local options to appear.

17 MS. PATTON: I did check to make sure
18 that Madison D is not in the Columbus School District
19 so no candidates will appear on the ballot, so that
20 was checked.

21 MR. SINNOTT: I move that the Board
22 certify to the May 5, 2015, Primary Election ballot
23 and the November 3, 2015, General Election ballot
24 those issues appearing on Exhibit C which were timely

1 filed and found by staff to be sufficient and valid.

2 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Is there a second?

3 MR. HAAS: Second.

4 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: All those in favor say
5 aye.

6 (Vote taken; motion passed.)

7 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Motion carries. The
8 next item on the agenda would be Exhibit D, the local
9 options not recommended.

10 MS. PATTON: On Exhibit D you will notice
11 there was one local option for Columbus 18F that we
12 are not recommending. They filed 157 signatures;
13 however, we found that 74 of them were invalid,
14 leaving them 30 short of the 113 requirement,
15 signature requirement, to place the issue on the
16 ballot. Due to that insufficiency we are
17 recommending that they not be certified to the
18 primary ballot.

19 MR. HAAS: Anybody here on behalf of
20 them?

21 MR. PREISSE: Doesn't look like it.

22 MR. HAAS: Move that the Board of
23 Elections deny certification to the May 5 Primary
24 Election ballot the issue appearing on Exhibit D on

1 the basis that the petition contained an insufficient
2 number of valid signatures.

3 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Is there a second?

4 MR. SINNOTT: There is.

5 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: All those in favor say
6 aye.

7 (Vote taken; motion passed.)

8 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Motion carries.

9 The next item on the agenda --

10 MR. SINNOTT: If I may, I don't know if
11 this is of any significance, but I noticed that when
12 I moved for Mr. Ragland's certification to the
13 ballot, I spoke only of the May Primary Election
14 ballot. I did not mention the November General
15 Election ballot. I don't think that's of any
16 relevance in this context. If it is, tell me and I
17 will rephrase the motion.

18 MR. WALCH: I don't think it is because
19 his candidacy would go to the primary.

20 MR. SINNOTT: That seems right to me,
21 too. Very well. Pardon the interruption.

22 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: The next item on the
23 agenda would be that it's the time of year the
24 company that we move our voting machines with, we put

1 that out to bid. It came back we had three good bids
2 on it, and Dana, myself, and Patrick Harris looked at
3 all three bids to see who would be the lowest and
4 best or the best, and we did a criteria analysis of
5 all three of the companies that bid on that. And
6 based on the criteria from that assessment, we deemed
7 that -- it wasn't the cheapest, but it was the best,
8 and it went to E.E. Ward so that's what we're here
9 now for.

10 Dana, do you have anything on that?

11 MR. WALCH: No. I think we had a good
12 process of Bill, Patrick, and I looking through this.
13 We scored each vendor on five different criteria.
14 We, all three, were in agreement that the E.E. Ward
15 bid was the best one. The three on price, they were
16 very close to another vendor. There were two vendors
17 that were very close in price, and the third vendor
18 was quite a bit more. Good quality company, I think
19 we all thought they would do a fine job, but their
20 price was considerably more than the other two, which
21 hurt them in our process. So we were all three in
22 agreement that E.E. Ward was the best proposal.

23 MR. PREISSE: We have been generally
24 happy with their service?

1 MR. WALCH: They have been the vendor
2 doing this for us and no complaints. They have done
3 a great job for us.

4 MR. HAAS: Based on that, I move that the
5 Board authorize that the Director and Deputy Director
6 to execute a contract with E.E. Ward Moving & Storage
7 Company through December 31, 2015 in the amount of
8 \$27.50 per cart per one-way move of voting machine
9 carts through December 31, 2015.

10 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Is there a second?

11 MR. SINNOTT: There is.

12 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: All those in favor say
13 aye.

14 (Vote taken; motion passed.)

15 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Motion carries.

16 The next item on the agenda is we
17 purchase a forklift. We need a new forklift. It was
18 over our \$10,000 limit. It was \$14,000, a
19 good-looking forklift. It cost \$14,100. We are kind
20 of backtracking. We already own it, but we need you
21 guys to approve it for us so we can pay the vendor.

22 MR. SINNOTT: Does it fit through that
23 strangely small door, Bill?

24 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: It fits that strangely

1 small door.

2 MR. MACKEY: Truly.

3 MR. WALCH: We checked all that out. We
4 are good to go on that one.

5 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: It meets all our
6 requirements.

7 MR. PREISSE: I think we should give the
8 forklift the name of Mo as a pneumonic device for the
9 guy that didn't make the door big enough.

10 MR. HAAS: I move that the Board
11 authorize that the Director and Deputy Director to
12 purchase a forklift from Miami Industrial Trucks for
13 the Board of Elections warehouse for \$14,100, and
14 name it Mo.

15 MR. SINNOTT: I second that motion.

16 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: All those in favor say
17 aye.

18 (Vote taken; motion passed.)

19 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Motion carries.

20 That's all we have for the committee. Is
21 there a motion to adjourn?

22 MR. HAAS: There is.

23 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Is there a second?

24 MR. SINNOTT: Yes, second to adjourn.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

DIRECTOR ANTHONY: All those in favor say
aye.

(Vote taken; motion passed.)

DIRECTOR ANTHONY: We stand adjourned.

(The meeting adjourned at 3:45 p.m.)

- - -

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

CERTIFICATE

I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true and correct transcript of the proceedings taken by me in this matter on Tuesday, February 17, 2015, and carefully compared with my original stenographic notes.

Rosemary Foster Anderson,
Professional Reporter and
Notary Public in and for
the State of Ohio.

My commission expires April 5, 2019.

(RFA-77767)

- - -

EXHIBIT A

Candidate Petitions Recommended for
Board Certification to the
May 5, 2015 Primary Election Ballot or the
November 4, 2015 General Election Ballot

Exhibit A: Candidate Petitions Recommended for Board Certification to the May 5, 2015 Primary Election Ballot

Mayor: Terry Boyd ()

Columbus Full Term

Mayor: Jeff Brown (Write-In)

Columbus Full Term

Mayor: Andrew J Ginther ()

Columbus Full Term

Mayor: Zach Scott ()

Columbus Full Term

Member of Council: Orie Givens III (Write-In)

Columbus Full Term

Member of Council: Josh Jaffe ()

Columbus Full Term

Member of Council: Zachary Michael Klein ()

Columbus Full Term

Member of Council: Kiwan R Lawson ()

Columbus Full Term

Member of Council: Michelle Marie Mills ()

Columbus Full Term

Member of Council: Will Petrik ()

Columbus Full Term

Member of Council: Francine C Ryan ()

Columbus Full Term

Member of Council: Besmira Sharrah ()

Columbus Full Term

Exhibit A: Candidate Petitions Recommended for Board Certification to the May 5, 2015 Primary Election Ballot

Member of Council: Ibrahima Sow ()

Columbus Full Term

Member of Council: Dimitrious Wayne Stanley ()

Columbus Full Term

Member of Council: Zachary E Manifold ()

Columbus Full Term

Mayor: Beryl D Anderson ()

Gahanna Full Term

Mayor: Joseph Gergley ()

Gahanna Full Term

Mayor: Ryan P. Jolley ()

Gahanna Full Term

Mayor: Tom Kneeland ()

Gahanna Full Term

Mayor: Jennifer Tisone Price ()

Gahanna Full Term

City Attorney: James E Hood (Republican)

Reynoldsburg Full Term

City Attorney: Daniel J Skinner (Republican)

Reynoldsburg Full Term

President of Council: Norm Brusk (Republican)

Reynoldsburg Full Term

President of Council: Doug Joseph (Republican)

Reynoldsburg Full Term

Exhibit A: Candidate Petitions Recommended for Board Certification to the May 5, 2015 Primary Election Ballot

Member of Council: Stephen M Cicak (Republican)
Reynoldsburg Ward 1 Full Term

Member of Council: Caleb Skinner (Republican)
Reynoldsburg Ward 1 Full Term

Member of Council: Leslie A Kelly (Republican)
Reynoldsburg Ward 2 Full Term

Member of Council: Brett Luzader (Republican)
Reynoldsburg Ward 2 Full Term

Member of Council: Mel Clemens (Republican)
Reynoldsburg Ward 4 Full Term

Member of Council: Pat Zollars (Republican)
Reynoldsburg Ward 4 Full Term

Board of Education: Brian Bainbridge ()
Columbus CSD Full Term

Board of Education: Gary L Baker, II ()
Columbus CSD Full Term

Board of Education: Eric S Brown ()
Columbus CSD Full Term

Board of Education: W. Shawna Gibbs ()
Columbus CSD Full Term

Board of Education: Mary Jo Hudson ()
Columbus CSD Full Term

Board of Education: Jim Hunter ()
Columbus CSD Full Term

Exhibit A: Candidate Petitions Recommended for Board Certification to the May 5, 2015 Primary Election Ballot

Board of Education: Bernadine K Kent ()
Columbus CSD Full Term

Board of Education: Tina Pierce ()
Columbus CSD Full Term

Board of Education: Bob Sharrah ()
Columbus CSD Full Term

Board of Education: Ben Tyson ()
Columbus CSD Full Term

: ()

: ()

: ()

: ()

: ()

: ()

: ()

: ()

Exhibit A: Candidate Petitions Recommended for Board Certification to the November 3, 2015 General Election Ballot

Judge-Municipal Court: Bill Pollitt ()

Franklin County Full Term Commencing 1-1-16

Judge-Municipal Court: Ted Barrows ()

Franklin County Full Term Commencing 1-2-16

Judge-Municipal Court: Michael Cassone ()

Franklin County Full Term Commencing 1-3-16

Judge-Municipal Court: Mark A. Hummer ()

Franklin County Full Term Commencing 1-3-16

Judge-Municipal Court: Paul Herbert ()

Franklin County Full Term Commencing 1-4-16

Judge-Municipal Court: Cynthia Ebner ()

Franklin County Full Term Commencing 1-5-16

Judge-Municipal Court: Carrie Glaeden ()

Franklin County Full Term Commencing 1-5-16

Judge-Municipal Court: Tony Paat ()

Franklin County Full Term Commencing 1-6-16

Judge-Municipal Court: Eileen Paley ()

Franklin County Full Term Commencing 1-6-16

Judge-Municipal Court: Eddie Pfau ()

Franklin County Full Term Commencing 1-6-16

Judge-Municipal Court: Jim O'Grady ()

Franklin County Full Term Commencing 1-7-16

Judge-Municipal Court: David Tyack ()

Franklin County Full Term Commencing 1-9-16

Exhibit A: Candidate Petitions Recommended for Board Certification to the May 5, 2015 Primary
Election Ballot

Judge-Municipal Court: Dan Hawkins ()

Franklin County Environmental Full Term Commencing 1-8-16

Member of Council: Shannon G. Hardin ()

Columbus Unexpired Term Ending 12-31-17

Member of Council: Ashley Wnek ()

Columbus Unexpired Term Ending 12-31-17

Mayor: Don Schonhardt (Republican)

Hilliard Full Term

Member of Council: Joe Erb (Republican)

Hilliard Full Term

Member of Council: Albert Iosue (Republican)

Hilliard Full Term

Member of Council: Nathan D. Painter (Republican)

Hilliard Full Term

Mayor: Brad McCloud (Republican)

Reynoldsburg Full Term

Mayor: Cornelius McGrady (Democrat)

Reynoldsburg Full Term

City Attorney: Kristin Bryant (Democrat)

Reynoldsburg Full Term

President of Council: Preston Stearns (Democrat)

Reynoldsburg Full Term

Member of Council: Michael Krakomberger (Democrat)

Reynoldsburg Ward 1 Full Term

Exhibit A: Candidate Petitions Recommended for Board Certification to the May 5, 2015 Primary Election Ballot

Member of Council: Mark McKenzie (Democrat)
Reynoldsburg Ward 2 Full Term

Member of Council: Marshall A. Spalding (Republican)
Reynoldsburg Ward 3 Full Term

Member of Council: Dondi E. Henderson (Democrat)
Reynoldsburg Ward 4 Full Term

Mayor: Leslie P. LaCorte ()
Whitehall Full Term

Mayor: Kim Maggard ()
Whitehall Full Term

City Attorney: Michael T. Bivens ()
Whitehall Full Term

Auditor: Dan A. Miller ()
Whitehall Full Term

City Treasurer: Leo Knoblauch ()
Whitehall Full Term

City Treasurer: Steve Quincel ()
Whitehall Full Term

President of Council: Jim Graham ()
Whitehall Full Term

Member of Council: Bob Bailey ()
Whitehall Full Term

Member of Council: Karen Conison ()
Whitehall Full Term

Exhibit A: Candidate Petitions Recommended for Board Certification to the May 5, 2015 Primary Election Ballot

Member of Council: Gerald Dixon ()

Whitehall Full Term

Member of Council: Wes Kantor ()

Whitehall Full Term

: ()

: ()

: ()

: ()

: ()

: ()

: ()

: ()

: ()

: ()

EXHIBIT B

**Candidate Petitions Not Recommended for
Board Certification**

Mayor: James C Ragland ()

Columbus Full Term

Nominating Committee did not contain the names of 5 registered electors of the city of Columbus

Member of Council: Doyline E Williams ()

Columbus Full Term

Insufficient Valid Signatures - Only 173 excess signatures were submitted, and over 293 invalid signatures were identified.

Board of Education: Johannes J. Christian ()

Columbus CSD Full Term

LATE - Filed after the 4:00 p.m. deadline on February 4, 2015.

Member of Council: Robert Stepp (Republican)

Hilliard Full Term

Insufficient Valid Signatures - Fourteen of the 55 signatures submitted were determined to be from outside of the city of Hilliard leaving the project nine signatures short of the requirement.

Member of Council: David Nixon ()

Whitehall Full Term

Insufficient Valid Signatures - Three of the 30 signatures submitted were determined to be invalid leaving the project three signatures short of the requirement.

EXHIBIT C

Local Questions and Issues Recommended for
Certification to the May 5, 2015
Primary/Special Election Ballot or the
November 3, 2015 General Election Ballot

EXHIBIT 'C'

**Local Questions/Issues and Local Liquor Options Recommended for Certification to the
May 5, 2015 Primary/Special Election Ballot**

#	Subdivision	Purpose	Rate
#	Hamilton Township – Proposed Tax Levy – Renewal and Increase	Police Protection	Renewal of 3.25 mills and an increase of 0.5 mill to constitute 3.75 mills, \$0.375 per \$100 valuation, for 5 years, commencing in 2015
#	Madison Township – Proposed Tax Levy – Additional	Fire Protection	5.25 mills, \$0.525 per \$100 valuation, for a continuing period of time, commencing in 2015
#	Perry Township – Proposed Tax Levy – Additional	Police Protection	3.5 mills, \$0.35 per \$100 valuation, for a continuing period of time, commencing in 2015
#	Plain Township – Proposed Tax Levy – Replacement and Decrease	Fire Protection	Replacement of 3.0 mills with 2.9 mills, being a reduction of 0.1 mill, \$0.29 per \$100 valuation, for a continuing period of time, commencing in 2015
#	Minerva Park – Proposed Tax Levy – Renewal	Current expenses	4 mills, \$0.40 per \$100 valuation, for 5 years, commencing June 1, 2015
#	Valleyview – Proposed Tax Levy – Additional	Police Protection	12.0 mills, \$1.20 per \$100 valuation, for a continuing period of time, commencing in 2015

Local Liquor Options

#	Subdivision	Days, Times, & Type of Sales /Business Name & Address
#	Columbus 11-B Local Option Particular Location	Sunday Sales (11am-midnight) (Beer) Certified Oil 980 Demorest Rd., Columbus, OH 43204 Filed by: Field Resource Mgmt. 2/2/15
#	Columbus 13-C Local Option Particular Location	Weekday Sales (Wine/Mixed Bev) Eagle Supermarket 1464 Cleveland Ave., Columbus, OH 43211 Filed by: Ahmad Quteifan 2/3/15
#	Columbus 13-C Local Option Particular Location	Sunday Sales (10am-midnight) (Wine/Mixed Bev) Eagle Supermarket 1464 Cleveland Ave., Columbus, OH 43211 Filed by: Ahmad Quteifan 2/3/15
#	Columbus 29-C Local Option Particular Location	Sunday Sales (11am-midnight) (Beer) Certified Oil 2483 Parsons Ave., Columbus, OH 43207 Filed by: Field Resource Mgmt. 2/2/15

EXHIBIT 'C'**Local Questions/Issues and Local Liquor Options Recommended for Certification to the
May 5, 2015 Primary/Special Election Ballot**

#	Subdivision	Days, Times, & Type of Sales /Business Name & Address
#	Columbus 35-A Local Option Particular Location	Sunday Sales (11am-midnight) (Wine/Mixed Bev) Livingston Shell 1937 E. Livingston Ave., Columbus, OH 43209 Filed by: Young Independent Consultants 1/23/15
#	Columbus 47-B Local Option Particular Location	Sunday Sales (11am-midnight) (Wine/Mixed Bev., Spirituous Liq.) Prime Ultra Lounge 980 Barnett Rd., Columbus, OH 43227 Filed by: Young Independent Consultants 2/4/15
#	Columbus 51-A Local Option Particular Location	Sunday Sales (11am-midnight) (Beer) Certified Oil 1950 Lockbourne Rd., Columbus, OH 43207 Filed by: Field Resource Mgmt. 2/2/15
#	Columbus 63-H Local Option Particular Location	Sunday Sales (11am-midnight) (Wine/Mixed Bev) Henderson Rd. Sunoco 2122 Henderson Rd., Columbus, OH 43220 Filed by: Young Independent Consultants 2/4/15
#	Columbus 67-C Local Option Particular Location	Sunday Sales (10am-midnight) (Wine/Mixed Bev) La Michoacana Mexican Market 534 Norton Rd., Columbus, OH 43228 Filed by: Henry Fein 1/30/15
#	Columbus 86-E Local Option Particular Location	Weekday Sales (Beer, Wine/Mixed Bev., Spirituous Liquor) The Sports Cantina Mexican Grille 5000-5004 Gender Rd., Columbus, OH 43110 Filed by: Young Independent Consultants 2/4/15
#	Columbus 86-E Local Option Particular Location	Sunday Sales (11am-midnight) (Wine/Mixed Bev., Spirituous Liq.) The Sports Cantina Mexican Grille 5000-5004 Gender Rd., Columbus, OH 43110 Filed by: Young Independent Consultants 2/4/15
#	Columbus 86-E Local Option Particular Location	Weekday Sales (Beer, Wine/Mixed Bev.) Gender Marketplace & Grinders 5020-5024 Gender Rd., Columbus, OH 43110 Filed by: Young Independent Consultants 2/4/15
#	Columbus 86-E Local Option Particular Location	Sunday Sales (11am-midnight) (Wine/Mixed Bev.) Gender Marketplace & Grinders 5020-5024 Gender Rd., Columbus, OH 43110 Filed by: Young Independent Consultants 2/4/15

This space left blank intentionally.

EXHIBIT 'C'

**Local Liquor Options Recommended for Certification to the
November 3, 2015 General Election Ballot**

**Information pertinent to issues identified below for certification to the
November General Election Ballot**

Local Liquor Options may only appear on the ballot when there are candidates on the ballot within that precinct. The following precincts do not have a ballot with candidates available in the May Primary/Special Election, but had local liquor option petitions filed and found to be sufficient.

#	Madison - D Local Option Particular Location	Weekday Sales (Beer, Wine/Mixed Bev) De Store 5091 Sedalia Dr., Columbus, OH 43232 Filed by: Henry Fein 1/30/15
#	Madison - D Local Option Particular Location	Sunday Sales (10am-midnight) (Wine/Mixed Bev) De Store 5091 Sedalia Dr., Columbus, OH 43232 Filed by: Henry Fein 1/30/15
#	Westerville 3-A Local Option Particular Location	Weekday Sales (Beer, Wine/Mixed Bev, Spirituous Liquor) The Aloft Hotel at Westerville 32 Heatherdown Dr., Westerville, OH 43081 Filed by: Henry Fein 2/3/15

EXHIBIT 'D'

The following local liquor option is **NOT** recommended for certification to the May 5, 2015 Primary/Special Election Ballot

Petition Information:

Staff Findings (Requirements and Deficiencies):

The following had an *Insufficient Number of Valid Signatures*

Columbus 18-F

157 Signatures submitted

Particular Location – Sunday Sales (10 a.m. – midnight)

➔ **INSUFFICIENT NUMBER VALID SIGNATURES**

Rambling House LLC

113 Signatures required

310-312 E. Hudson St., Columbus, OH 43202

83 Valid signatures found

Filed by: John Lynch

30 Signatures needed to meet requirement

EXHIBIT D

**Local Questions and Issues Not Recommended
for Certification**