



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24

APPEARANCES:

Franklin County Prosecutor's Office  
By Mr. Harold J. Anderson, III  
Assistant Prosecuting Attorney  
Civil Division-Environmental  
373 South High Street, 13th Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

On behalf of the Board.

ALSO PRESENT:

Ms. Suzanne Brown,  
Executive Assistant to the Board

Ms. Renee Klco,  
Manager of Voter Services,  
Franklin County Board of Elections

Ms. Brenna Umbstaetter,  
Manager of Fiscal Services,  
Franklin County Board of Elections

Mr. Ben Piscitelli,  
Public Information Officer,  
Franklin County Board of Elections

- - -

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24

INDEX

- - -

ITEM	PAGE
Voter Registration Challenges	4
Voting Machine Allocation for the March 6, 2012 Primary Election	7
Budget Update	10
Health Insurance Benefits	16
Adjourn	22

- - -

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24

- - - - -

P R O C E E D I N G S

- - - - -

DIRECTOR ANTHONY: I would like to call the Franklin County Board of Elections meeting to order. I'll do the roll call.

Kimberly Marinello?

BOARD MEMBER MARINELLO: Here.

DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Zachary Manifold?

BOARD MEMBER MANIFOLD: Here.

DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Douglas Priesse?

CHAIRMAN PRIESSE: Here.

DIRECTOR ANTHONY: And Michael Colley?

BOARD MEMBER COLLEY: Here.

DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Before we start, the court reporter wanted to give you guys some instructions.

(Off the record.)

DIRECTOR ANTHONY: All right. This is a special meeting called to order and I've done the roll call. The first item on the agenda is we had a few challenges and I'd like for Renee Klco, the Manager of Voter Services, to give a report.

MS. KLCO: The first challenge is by

1 Deborah Dawson. She is challenging the right to vote  
2 of Mariah Smith. Mariah Smith was registered through  
3 the Secretary of State's office in 2011. Where she  
4 says she lives is actually property owned by Deborah  
5 Dawson who says she does not reside at that address.  
6 She has never voted and it is our recommendation that  
7 she be cancelled.

8 The second challenge is made by Cynthia  
9 Donahey. She is challenging Douglas W. Scott for his  
10 right to vote. Cynthia Donahey owns the property.  
11 She has not rented any of the apartments to  
12 Mr. Scott. Mr. Scott registered in 2004 through the  
13 mail and he last voted in 2008. It's also our  
14 recommendation that he be cancelled.

15 CHAIRMAN PRIESSE: All right. Any  
16 concerns or questions of the Board?

17 You've done your due diligence?

18 MS. KLCO: I have.

19 CHAIRMAN PRIESSE: You've spoken to the  
20 challengers and looked into it and you're satisfied  
21 that these matters are as --

22 MS. KLCO: Should be upheld.

23 CHAIRMAN PRIESSE: Okay. Questions?

24 BOARD MEMBER MARINELLO: Mr. Chairman, I

1 move that the Board grant the Challenge of Right to  
2 Vote and Correction of Registration List filed by  
3 Deborah Dawson of 2410 Meredith Drive, Columbus,  
4 Ohio, against Mariah Smith, purportedly of 2410  
5 Meredith Drive, Columbus, Ohio, and order that Mariah  
6 Smith's registration be immediately cancelled in  
7 Franklin County.

8 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Is there a second?

9 BOARD MEMBER COLLEY: Second.

10 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: All those in favor,  
11 say aye.

12 BOARD MEMBERS: Aye.

13 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: The next item on the  
14 agenda --

15 CHAIRMAN PRIESSE: We got one more.

16 BOARD MEMBER MANIFOLD: We got one more.  
17 We've got the other one.

18 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: I'm sorry.

19 BOARD MEMBER MANIFOLD: Mr. Chairman, I  
20 move that the Board grant the Challenge of Right to  
21 Vote and Correction of Registration List filed by  
22 Cynthia Donahey of 306 East 11th Avenue, Columbus,  
23 Ohio, against Douglas W. Scott purportedly of 306  
24 East 11th Avenue, Columbus, Ohio, and order that

1 Douglas W. Scott's registration be immediately  
2 cancelled in Franklin County.

3 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Is there a second?

4 BOARD MEMBER MARINELLO: Second.

5 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: All those in favor,  
6 say aye.

7 BOARD MEMBERS: Aye.

8 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: That motion carries.

9 The next item on the agenda is the  
10 machine allocation for the March 6th primary  
11 election.

12 DEPUTY DIRECTOR WALCH: It's Exhibit A.

13 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Exhibit A. You all  
14 got one.

15 MS. BROWN: Yeah.

16 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: You should have one.

17 CHAIRMAN PRIESSE: That's this?

18 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: That's that, yes. And  
19 you can kind of go through there. Lisa spent a lot  
20 of hours looking at this and refining it and, as you  
21 all know, this is a presidential election and we need  
22 to let folks know where we're going to allocate  
23 machines to, and how many machines we're going to  
24 allocate to each location.

1           This allocation will have a minimum of  
2 three machines at a location if it's a small  
3 location, so there will be at least three machines in  
4 every voting location in Franklin County. I think  
5 the max that we're going to have is 35 machines.

6           DEPUTY DIRECTOR WALCH: 35, that's right.

7           DIRECTOR ANTHONY: And that's at one  
8 location. And this -- this is a LID order.

9           CHAIRMAN PRIESSE: It's a what order?

10          DIRECTOR ANTHONY: LID order, location  
11 order.

12          CHAIRMAN PRIESSE: Location order.

13          DIRECTOR ANTHONY: And if you look at  
14 this form, you see the LID number, location ID,  
15 location name, the number of registered voters in  
16 that particular precinct, and the number of machines  
17 that we allocated.

18          BOARD MEMBER MARINELLO: Is that rule  
19 going to affect one for every 175?

20          DIRECTOR ANTHONY: We followed this as  
21 closely as we could. I think so, it's going to be  
22 real close to that number. We're going to end up  
23 deploying 4,309 machines on Election Day. We have --  
24 we're going to hold some back because we're going to

1 need some here. We have about 50 machines in this  
2 room for early absentee voting, and then we hold back  
3 another 50 or so machines in case a machine breaks  
4 down on Election Day, so we will be able to replace  
5 it. This is similar to what we did in 2008.  
6 Actually, we allocated more than we did in 2008. In  
7 2008 we put out 4,289 machines.

8 BOARD MEMBER MANIFOLD: How's the --  
9 where are we at on the battery replacement? Is that  
10 going along smoothly?

11 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: We haven't started.  
12 We decided to wait until after the election. We  
13 didn't want our machines to be in a state of  
14 maintenance. We were waiting to -- we're going to  
15 wait.

16 Now, we did the PEBs, we did ship out  
17 1,500 PEBs to get the batteries changed, but we have  
18 enough PEBs in reserve that if something happens it's  
19 not going to impact the election.

20 We plan to -- on that note, we plan to  
21 have the maintenance start on these machines, we  
22 can't touch the machines until 60 days after the  
23 election, so 60 days after the March 6th election  
24 we'll start the maintenance on them.

1 CHAIRMAN PRIESSE: Anybody have any  
2 questions, any concerns?

3 (No response.)

4 CHAIRMAN PRIESSE: I don't have any.  
5 Do we have a motion?

6 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: We need a motion.

7 BOARD MEMBER COLLEY: Here?

8 DEPUTY DIRECTOR WALCH: Yes, that's  
9 right.

10 BOARD MEMBER COLLEY: Mr. Chairman, I  
11 move that the Board adopt the voting machine  
12 allocation formula in Exhibit A, compiled by the  
13 Board staff for the March 6, 2012 Primary Election.

14 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Is there a second?

15 BOARD MEMBER MARINELLO: Second.

16 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: All those in favor,  
17 say aye.

18 BOARD MEMBERS: Aye.

19 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: The motion carries.

20 The last item on the agenda is a couple  
21 things, a budget update, and you have before you our  
22 budget for 2012 that was submitted to the OBM, Office  
23 of Budget Management. It's pretty self-explanatory,  
24 but if you could take a moment to kind of look at it.

1 We have Brenna Umbstaetter, our fiscal officer. If  
2 you have any questions, you can direct them to her.  
3 She can answer them if you have any questions on  
4 these. She's done a real great job of preparing this  
5 for us and it's all been approved and we're ready to  
6 go.

7 CHAIRMAN PRIESSE: I think we discussed  
8 this in the past. What's the significant reduction  
9 in the -- from the '8 to the '12, both presidential  
10 years?

11 MS. UMBSTAETTER: Primarily  
12 ballot-printing expense. We were using outside  
13 vendors to print.

14 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Why don't you come up  
15 here.

16 CHAIRMAN PRIESSE: Okay. Yeah, I recall,  
17 I think that's what you told us.

18 MS. UMBSTAETTER: We had the outside  
19 vendors printing ballot stock at that point and we  
20 had an inadequate history to determine the ordering  
21 quantities for the paper backup, paper by choice on  
22 Election Day. So the combination of the two was  
23 approximately a million dollars of printing-expense  
24 difference.

1           DIRECTOR ANTHONY: And during that time,  
2 we do print on demand, so we really limited our  
3 printing cost and made it really efficient.

4           CHAIRMAN PRIESSE: So, for example, if  
5 there was a reporter in the room and they wanted to  
6 take note of this savings, they would be able to do  
7 that.

8           MS. UMBSTAETTER: Yes.

9           CHAIRMAN PRIESSE: And, Bill, the  
10 printing on demand, we don't have to have the  
11 stockpiles laying around that we did.

12          DIRECTOR ANTHONY: What we do is we still  
13 try to have enough paper stock available, but what  
14 we're not doing is printing all these ballots that  
15 become --

16          CHAIRMAN PRIESSE: Because they become  
17 obsolete as soon as --

18          DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Well, we have to hold  
19 on to them as well. When we print a ballot, we have  
20 to hold on to them, some of them, for 22 months,  
21 particularly for a federal election.

22          CHAIRMAN PRIESSE: Okay.

23          DIRECTOR ANTHONY: So we -- so we -- this  
24 eliminates. And, plus, if we were printing, we would

1 have to print what we think we would need, so we  
2 would do an estimate and say we figure, you know,  
3 400,000 voters are going to show up on Election Day,  
4 we would have to have ready to go 400,000 pieces of  
5 paper broken down by each precinct. Now we don't do  
6 that. We take a look at it and we print,  
7 particularly for the absentee, we print for whoever  
8 asks for one, we get them printed.

9 DEPUTY DIRECTOR WALCH: But to your other  
10 point, too, yes, if we print up, you know, a lot of  
11 them, if we don't use them, yeah, they are obsolete  
12 as soon as the election is over.

13 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Yes.

14 DEPUTY DIRECTOR WALCH: The only purpose,  
15 then, they ever served was for us to have to retain  
16 them according to the retention schedule that we  
17 have. Having the ballot-on-demand allows us really  
18 to cut down the amount that we do end up just storing  
19 for months at a time afterwards that didn't even get  
20 used.

21 CHAIRMAN PRIESSE: The paper stock should  
22 be good into the future.

23 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Yes.

24 DEPUTY DIRECTOR WALCH: Yes.

1 MS. UMBSTAETTER: Yes.

2 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Absolutely. And the  
3 paper stock, we keep it stored downstairs, and we  
4 have the paper stock that we need.

5 MS. UMBSTAETTER: That stock is referred  
6 to as "ballot shells" because it is already prepared  
7 for printing. It has the clipped corner and a  
8 perforation at the bottom for the stub, so that we  
9 don't have to do any specialized cutting once it's  
10 here, which enables them to do that, you know, within  
11 a few minutes of generating the file.

12 We always did a small amount of the  
13 ballot-on-demand printing for unexpected increases in  
14 demand for certain ballot styles or if we had ballot  
15 styles that only applied to a small number of voters  
16 in a particular precinct split. But now that we are  
17 doing each processing batch as ballot-on-demand, not  
18 only does it eliminate the over-purchasing ahead of  
19 time and the storage afterwards, it also is an  
20 increase in security measures because we do not have  
21 any live ballot stock on the premises other than  
22 what's being processed at that time on any given day.

23 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Now, we will be coming  
24 to you guys at the February Board meeting, this is

1 the Presidential Election Cycle, where we're going to  
2 have to print a minimum of 10 percent of the  
3 projected, based on -- how do I say it -- we have to  
4 print some ballots, at least have 10 percent ballots  
5 in each precinct, 10 percent in each precinct  
6 location based on either last year's or 2008's  
7 turnout, we're going to have to have 10 percent paper  
8 available in case folks don't want to vote on our  
9 voting machines. And we're still going to have to  
10 have paper available that we would make available for  
11 provisional voting. So we are going to have some  
12 expense. I think we looked at 2008 and something  
13 like 230,000 --

14 DEPUTY DIRECTOR WALCH: There were about  
15 230,000 that voted in person --

16 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Right.

17 DEPUTY DIRECTOR WALCH: -- in 2008  
18 between regular votes and provisional votes and the  
19 17-year-old ballots, that sort of thing, there was  
20 about 230,000 that voted in person. And that was a  
21 relatively high turnout for a primary election.  
22 There was the contested presidential nomination on  
23 the Democrat side that threw a lot of votes out in  
24 2008, but it is based on the last like-election which

1 would have been the 2008 primary.

2 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: We have to have at  
3 least 10 percent paper available for voters who  
4 request a paper ballot.

5 CHAIRMAN PRIESSE: Okay.

6 DEPUTY DIRECTOR WALCH: Do you want to  
7 brief them on the order of business on the insurance,  
8 or do you want Brenna to do that or --

9 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Yeah, we can.

10 DEPUTY DIRECTOR WALCH: How do you want  
11 to do that?

12 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: We can do that next.  
13 The next item is it is time for the --

14 CHAIRMAN PRIESSE: Thanks, Brenna.

15 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: -- thanks, Brenna --  
16 our annual increase in health insurance benefits. We  
17 got a communique from the -- from the Commissioners  
18 stating that the rates did go up for this new -- for  
19 2012 and 2013 cycle. And so we have always opted to  
20 go with the Commissioners' plan for the proposed  
21 contribution rates and so that rate has increased.  
22 You should have that in front of you, too. You guys  
23 got that?

24 DEPUTY DIRECTOR WALCH: They do have

1 that, yes.

2           DIRECTOR ANTHONY: And it breaks down our  
3 share of that. This is an employee share. We  
4 currently don't -- we pick up our portion of it and  
5 then the employees have a share that they pick up.  
6 And the employee share, as you can see in that  
7 next-to-last column there, their share, employee plus  
8 the children, basically a single parent plus kids  
9 will go from \$60 to \$95 a month, and family rates  
10 will go from 160 to 195.

11           We don't do the negotiation for that.  
12 The County enters in negotiation with the health  
13 insurance provider and we go with the rate that they  
14 basically agreed upon or decide upon or the  
15 contractual rate that they had.

16           And also, if you need additional  
17 information, Brenna can probably add to that, but I  
18 think that pretty much covered it.

19           BOARD MEMBER MANIFOLD: You know, I don't  
20 have a problem with us matching what other county  
21 agencies do. I do have a concern, though, that, you  
22 know, \$35 a month, you know, if you time that out  
23 over a year, our low-end employees that just got a  
24 1-and-a-half-percent increase for this year and

1 1 percent last year, and these increases keep going  
2 up, essentially you've ate that 1. I mean, it  
3 doesn't take a genius to do the math.

4 Essentially our employees are probably  
5 going on somewhere around three or four years now  
6 where this has gone up like this and their salary  
7 hasn't moved or it's moved 1 percent which is being  
8 eaten up by this. So just a thought that we're  
9 going, you know --

10 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: I hear you loud and  
11 clear.

12 BOARD MEMBER MANIFOLD: -- at some point  
13 we have to get over that 1-, 1-and-a-half percent  
14 annual increase. We're going to continue to -- I  
15 know it's rough times and everybody is scaling back.  
16 I definitely think there's concern there. You know,  
17 maybe it's something we talk to the Commissioners  
18 about. I don't know if they ever thought about it.

19 My wife used to work for Cardinal Health,  
20 a lot of companies do progressive or, you know,  
21 monthly amounts like you make, you know, all low-end  
22 employees pay X for a percentage so you're still  
23 getting all the same money, but, you know, different  
24 levels of employees pay different amounts for their

1 health care premium. So it's something to think  
2 about. A lot of corporations out there are doing it.  
3 Maybe it's something to bring up. I'm sure there is  
4 a committee that handles this stuff for the county.  
5 There are more progressive systems so low-end  
6 employees essentially aren't seeing their entire  
7 annual increase eaten up by their health-insurance  
8 increase.

9 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Good point. I will  
10 have that conversation with the benefit folks and see  
11 what we can or cannot do.

12 BOARD MEMBER MANIFOLD: It's just a  
13 thought.

14 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: It's a good thought  
15 and maybe we can address it when we talk about, you  
16 know, the --

17 BOARD MEMBER MANIFOLD: When we do our  
18 annual increases --

19 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Annual increase.

20 BOARD MEMBER MANIFOLD: -- maybe we can  
21 work on that then.

22 MS. UMBSTAETTER: Director Anthony?

23 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Yes.

24 MS. UMBSTAETTER: Without knowing too

1 many of the nuts and bolts of their calculation  
2 process, I know that this is one piece of how they  
3 are redistributing costs and controlling costs, but  
4 they're also looking at cost controls in the plan  
5 modifications that are made from year to year with  
6 things like copayment levels.

7 Our payroll officer and I have been to a  
8 couple of update meetings with this plan over the  
9 years. And they do pretty actively manage keeping  
10 the plan costs as low as possible, and it is some  
11 mixture of encouraging the most economic use of the  
12 plan and manipulating the employee contribution.

13 And I think, relative to a lot of other  
14 employers, we do have what is considered to be  
15 above-average, really pretty excellent coverage.

16 DEPUTY DIRECTOR WALCH: I think we need a  
17 motion to accept that modification.

18 BOARD MEMBER MANIFOLD: Mr. Chairman, I  
19 move that the Board adopt the new standard monthly  
20 employment health benefit contribution rate of \$95  
21 per month for employee coverage only, and \$195 per  
22 month for family coverage as prescribed by the  
23 Franklin County Commissioners for the time period of  
24 April 1st, 2012 through March 31st, 2013.

1 DIRECTOR ANTHONY: Is there a second?

2 BOARD MEMBER MARINELLO: Second.

3 CHAIRMAN PRIESSE: I have a question:  
4 Just as this is written, "\$95 per month for employee  
5 coverage only."

6 BOARD MEMBER MANIFOLD: Oh, plus child.  
7 I should amend the --

8 DEPUTY DIRECTOR WALCH: We should amend  
9 it.

10 BOARD MEMBER MANIFOLD: -- the \$95 for  
11 employee and also "or employee plus children."

12 DEPUTY DIRECTOR WALCH: "Plus children."  
13 And the higher one for a spouse and family.

14 MS. UMBSTAETTER: Our OMB analyst sitting  
15 here tells me that basically we add the children onto  
16 the coverage for free. That even though the  
17 terminology is not specified in the HR materials,  
18 it's really individual and spousal coverage, so it  
19 either can be with or without children. And we do  
20 have the new structure for it's -- it's now spouse or  
21 domestic partner.

22 CHAIRMAN PRIESSE: Okay. You've amended  
23 it.

24 BOARD MEMBER MARINELLO: I second.



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24

CERTIFICATE

I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true and correct transcript of the proceedings taken by me in this matter on Friday, January 13, 2012, and carefully compared with my original stenographic notes.

---

Carolyn M. Burke, Registered Professional Reporter, and Notary Public in and for the State of Ohio.

My commission expires July 17, 2013.

- - -